IN THE IOWA ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS DIVISION UNEMPLOYMENT INSURANCE APPEALS BUREAU

MARY E FRIDAY Claimant

APPEAL 23A-UI-06640-S2-T

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE DECISION

ROSARIUM PR & MARKETING

Employer

OC: 06/12/22 Claimant: Respondent (4R)

Iowa Code § 96.8(5) – Liability of Certain Employers Iowa Admin. Code r. 871—23.19 – Employer/Employee Relationship Iowa Code § 96.5(2)a – Discharge for Misconduct

STATEMENT OF THE CASE:

The putative employer filed an appeal from the June 26, 2023, (reference 08) unemployment insurance decision that allowed benefits based upon a determination claimant was discharged with no evidence of misconduct. The parties were properly notified of the hearing. A telephone hearing was held on July 24, 2023. Claimant Mary E. Friday did not participate. Employer Rosarium PR & Marketing participated through chief executive officer and owner Alexia Quintal and was represented by attorney Harold Widdison. Employer's Exhibits 1 - 4 were offered and admitted. The administrative law judge took official notice of the claimant's unemployment insurance benefits records.

ISSUE:

Did claimant work for this employer?

FINDINGS OF FACT:

Having reviewed all of the evidence in the record, the administrative law judge finds: Employer asserts that claimant did not work as an employee for this business entity. Claimant provided consulting services and Rosarium was one of her clients. Claimant provided her own tools and office and set her own schedule. Rosarium did not withhold taxes. Claimant performed work as an independent contractor and signed a work agreement stating she was an independent contractor.

No investigation and determination regarding whether claimant was an employee or independent contractor for Rosarium PR & Marketing has been made by the Tax Bureau of IWD.

REASONING AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW:

Iowa Code section 96.1A(15)a provides in pertinent part:

Except as otherwise provided in this subsection, "employment" means service, including service in interstate commerce, performed for wages or under any contract of hire, written or oral, expressed or implied. Employment also means any service performed prior to January 1, 1978, which was employment as defined in this subsection prior to such date and, subject to the other provisions of this subsection, service performed after December 31, 1977, by:...

Iowa Admin. Code r.871-23.19 provides:

Employer-employee and independent contractor relationship.

(1) The relationship of employer and employee exists when the person for whom services are performed has the right to control and direct the individual who performs the services, not only as to the result to be accomplished by the work but also as to the details and means by which that result is accomplished. An employee is subject to the will and control of the employer not only as to what shall be done but how it shall be done. It is not necessary that the employer actually direct or control the manner in which the services are performed; it is sufficient if the employer has the right to do so. The right to discharge or terminate a relationship is also an important factor indicating that the person possessing that right is an employer. Where such discharge or termination will constitute a breach of contract and the discharging person may be liable for damages, the circumstances indicate a relationship of independent contractor. Other factors characteristic of an employer, but not necessarily present in every case, are the furnishing of tools, equipment, material and a place to work to the individual who performs the services. In general, if an individual is subject to the control or direction of another merely as to the result to be accomplished by the work and not as to the means and methods for accomplishing the result, that individual is an independent contractor. An individual performing services as an independent contractor is not as to such services an employee under the usual common law rules. Individuals such as physicians, lawyers, dentists, veterinarians, construction contractors, public stenographers, and auctioneers, engaged in the pursuit of an independent trade, occupation, business or profession, in which they offer services to the public, are independent contractors and not employees. Professional employees who perform services for another individual or legal entity are covered employees.

(2) The nature of the contract undertaken by one for the performance of a certain type, kind, or piece of work at a fixed price is a factor to be considered in determining the status of an independent contractor. In general, employees perform the work continuously and primarily their labor is purchased, whereas the independent contractor undertakes the performance of a specific job. Independent contractors follow a distinct trade, occupation, business, or profession in which they offer their services to the public to be performed without the control of those seeking the benefit of their training or experience.

(3) Independent contractors can make a profit or loss. They are more likely to have unreimbursed expenses than employees and to have fixed, ongoing costs regardless of whether work is currently being performed. Independent contractors often have significant investment in real or personal property that they use in performing services for someone else.

(4) Employees are usually paid a fixed wage computed on a weekly or hourly basis while an independent contractor is usually paid one sum for the entire work, whether it be paid in the form of a lump sum or installments. The employer-employee relationship may exist regardless of the form, measurement, designation or manner of remuneration.

(5) The right to employ assistants with the exclusive right to supervise their activity and completely delegate the work is an indication of an independent contractor relationship.

(6) Services performed by an individual for remuneration are presumed to be employment unless and until it is shown to the satisfaction of the department that the individual is in fact an independent contractor. Whether the relationship of employer and employee exists under the usual common law rules will be determined upon an examination of the particular facts of each case.

(7) If the relationship of employer and employee exists, the designation or description of the relationship by the parties as anything other than that of employer and employee is immaterial. Thus, if such relationship exists, it is of no consequence that the employee is designated as a partner, coadventurer, agent, independent contractor, or the like.

(8) All classes or grades of employees are included within the relationship of employer and employee. For example, superintendents, managers and other supervisory personnel are employees.

The lowa Employment Security Law deals only with employment relationships. If the claimant is not an employee, the circumstances surrounding the severance of the business relationship with that company are immaterial to the claim for unemployment insurance benefits.

The administrative law judge has reviewed the records and files herein and concludes that the representative's decision shall be modified without prejudice to either party because claimant never worked for this business entity as an employee.

DECISION:

The June 26, 2023, (reference 08) unemployment insurance decision is modified without prejudice to either party as claimant did not work as an employee for this business entity. Claimant shall not be denied benefits based upon this decision and this employer shall not be responsible for benefit charges.

REMAND:

The issue of whether claimant is an independent contractor is remanded to the Tax Bureau of lowa Workforce Development for an initial investigation and determination.

Stephane allesson

Stephanie Adkisson Administrative Law Judge

July 26, 2023 Decision Dated and Mailed

scn

APPEAL RIGHTS. If you disagree with the decision, you or any interested party may:

1. Appeal to the Employment Appeal Board within fifteen (15) days of the date under the judge's signature by submitting a written appeal via mail, fax, or online to:

Employment Appeal Board 4th Floor – Lucas Building Des Moines, Iowa 50319 Fax: (515)281-7191 Online: eab.iowa.gov

The appeal period will be extended to the next business day if the last day to appeal falls on a weekend or a legal holiday.

AN APPEAL TO THE BOARD SHALL STATE CLEARLY:

1) The name, address, and social security number of the claimant.

2) A reference to the decision from which the appeal is taken.

3) That an appeal from such decision is being made and such appeal is signed.

4) The grounds upon which such appeal is based.

An Employment Appeal Board decision is final agency action. If a party disagrees with the Employment Appeal Board decision, they may then file a petition for judicial review in district court.

2. If no one files an appeal of the judge's decision with the Employment Appeal Board within fifteen (15) days, the decision becomes final agency action, and you have the option to file a petition for judicial review in District Court within thirty (30) days after the decision becomes final. Additional information on how to file a petition can be found at lowa Code §17A.19, which is online at https://www.legis.iowa.gov/docs/code/17A.19.pdf or by contacting the District Court Clerk of Court https://www.iowacourts.gov/iowa-courts/court-directory/.

Note to Parties: YOU MAY REPRESENT yourself in the appeal or obtain a lawyer or other interested party to do so provided there is no expense to Workforce Development. If you wish to be represented by a lawyer, you may obtain the services of either a private attorney or one whose services are paid for with public funds.

Note to Claimant: It is important that you file your weekly claim as directed, while this appeal is pending, to protect your continuing right to benefits.

SERVICE INFORMATION:

A true and correct copy of this decision was mailed to each of the parties listed.

DERECHOS DE APELACIÓN. Si no está de acuerdo con la decisión, usted o cualquier parte interesada puede:

1. Apelar a la Junta de Apelaciones de Empleo dentro de los quince (15) días de la fecha bajo la firma del juez presentando una apelación por escrito por correo, fax o en línea a:

Employment Appeal Board 4th Floor – Lucas Building Des Moines, Iowa 50319 Fax: (515)281-7191 En línea: eab.iowa.gov

El período de apelación se extenderá hasta el siguiente día hábil si el último día para apelar cae en fin de semana o día feriado legal.

UNA APELACIÓN A LA JUNTA DEBE ESTABLECER CLARAMENTE:

1) El nombre, dirección y número de seguro social del reclamante.

2) Una referencia a la decisión de la que se toma la apelación.

3) Que se interponga recurso de apelación contra tal decisión y se firme dicho recurso.

4) Los fundamentos en que se funda dicho recurso.

Una decisión de la Junta de Apelaciones de Empleo es una acción final de la agencia. Si una de las partes no está de acuerdo con la decisión de la Junta de Apelación de Empleo, puede presentar una petición de revisión judicial en el tribunal de distrito.

2. Si nadie presenta una apelación de la decisión del juez ante la Junta de Apelaciones Laborales dentro de los quince (15) días, la decisión se convierte en acción final de la agencia y usted tiene la opción de presentar una petición de revisión judicial en el Tribunal de Distrito dentro de los treinta (30) días después de que la decisión adquiera firmeza. Puede encontrar información adicional sobre cómo presentar una petición en el Código de Iowa §17A.19, que se encuentra en línea en https://www.legis.iowa.gov/docs/code/17A.19.pdf o comunicándose con el Tribunal de Distrito Secretario del tribunal https://www.iowacourts.gov/iowa-courts/court-directory/.

Nota para las partes: USTED PUEDE REPRESENTARSE en la apelación u obtener un abogado u otra parte interesada para que lo haga, siempre que no haya gastos para Workforce Development. Si desea ser representado por un abogado, puede obtener los servicios de un abogado privado o uno cuyos servicios se paguen con fondos públicos.

Nota para el reclamante: es importante que presente su reclamo semanal según las instrucciones, mientras esta apelación está pendiente, para proteger su derecho continuo a los beneficios.

SERVICIO DE INFORMACIÓN:

Se envió por correo una copia fiel y correcta de esta decisión a cada una de las partes enumeradas.