IOWA DEPARTMENT OF INSPECTIONS AND APPEALS ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS DIVISION, UI APPEALS BUREAU

ELYSE MELE

Claimant

APPEAL 22A-UI-18597-LJ-T

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE DECISION

PDG ENTERPRISES LLC

Employer

OC: 04/19/20

Claimant: Respondent (4)

Iowa Code § 96.6(2) – Timeliness of Protest Iowa Code § 96.7(2)a(6) – Appeal from the Statement of Charges

STATEMENT OF THE CASE:

On February 12, 2021, PDG Enterprises, L.L.C. (employer) filed an appeal from the statement of charges dated November 9, 2020, reference 00, for the third quarter of 2020. A hearing was held at 11:10 a.m. on Tuesday, November 15, 2022, after the parties waived ten days' notice on a recorded line. Appeals 22A-UI-17614-LJ-T, 22A-UI-18596-LJ-T, and 22A-UI-18597-LJ-T were heard together and created one record. Claimant Elyse Mele participated. Employer PDG Enterprises LLC participated through designated representative Kathy Kessler and Peter Kessler. The Department's Exhibits D1, D2, D-3, D-4, and D-5 were admitted into the record.

ISSUES:

Was the employer's protest timely? Was the employer's appeal from the statement of charges timely?

FINDINGS OF FACT:

Having reviewed all of the evidence in the record, the administrative law judge finds: The claimant worked for the employer as a server and bartender. She separated from employment on September 20, 2019 and subsequently she filed a claim for benefits effective April 19, 2020. The notice of claim was mailed to the employer's address of record on April 21, 2020. (Exhibit D-1) The employer did not receive that notice of claim. Next, the Tax Bureau of Iowa Workforce Development ("IWD") sent out the August 7, 2020 statement of charges for the second quarter of 2020. (Exhibit D-4) Kathy Kessler recalled receiving that statement of charges. She made a telephone call to IWD and spoke to someone but did not ultimately appeal at the time.

Several months later, IWD sent the employer the November 9, 2020 statement of charges for the third quarter of 2020. (Exhibit D-5) Kessler has detailed notes on her copy of this statement of charges indicating she emailed the agency on November 25, 2020 and received a response via email on December 3, 2020. Kessler believed she had gotten her appeal on file through this correspondence by the appeal deadline of December 9, 2020.

Next, IWD sent the employer the February 9, 2021 statement of charges for the fourth quarter of 2020. (Exhibit D-2) When Kessler received this statement of charges, she immediately appealed via email. (Exhibit D-3) Due to agency error, this appeal was not properly docketed and scheduled for hearing at the time Kessler filed it in February 2021. Therefore, on September 29, 2022, Peter Kessler re-forwarded Kathy Kessler's message to inquire about the appeal and the status of the employer's account. The Administrative Hearings Division UI Appeals Bureau of the Iowa Department of Inspections and Appeals promptly docketed the appeal and set the matter for hearing.

The administrative record shows that since separating from this employment and prior to opening her claim effective April 19, 2020, claimant earned more than ten times her \$399.00 weekly benefit amount, or \$3,990.00, with IRL Hospitality LLC.

REASONING AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW:

For the reasons that follow, the administrative law judge concludes the employer did file a timely appeal to the statement of charges and the claimant has requalified for benefits.

Iowa Code section 96.6(2) provides, in pertinent part:

2. Initial determination. A representative designated by the director shall promptly notify all interested parties to the claim of its filing, and the parties have ten days from the date of mailing the notice of the filing of the claim by ordinary mail to the last known address to protest payment of benefits to the claimant.

Iowa Code section 96.7(2)a(6) provides:

- 2. Contribution rates based on benefit experience.
- a. (6) Within forty days after the close of each calendar quarter, the department shall notify each employer of the amount of benefits charged to the employer's account during that quarter. The notification shall show the name of each individual to whom benefits were paid, the individual's social security number, and the amount of benefits paid to the individual. An employer which has not been notified as provided in section 96.6, subsection 2, of the allowance of benefits to an individual, may within thirty days after the date of mailing of the notification appeal to the department for a hearing to determine the eligibility of the individual to receive benefits. The appeal shall be referred to an administrative law judge for hearing and the employer and the individual shall receive notice of the time and place of the hearing.

Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-26.4 provides, in relevant part:

- 2. An appeal from an initial decision concerning the allowance or denial of benefits shall be filed, by mail, facsimile, or e-mail, online, or in person, not later than ten calendar days, as determined by the postmark or the date stamp after the decision was mailed to the party at its last-known address and shall state the following:
- a. The name, address and social security number of the claimant;
- b. A reference to the decision from which appeal is taken; and,
- c. The grounds upon which the appeal is based.

- 3. Notwithstanding the provisions of subrule 26.4(2), a contributory employer, which has not previously received a notice of the filing of a valid claim for benefits, may appeal an individual's eligibility to receive benefits within 30 days from the mailing date of the quarterly statement of benefit charges.
- 4. Also notwithstanding the provisions of subrule 26.4(2), a reimbursable employer, which has not previously received a notice of the filing of a valid claim for benefits, may appeal an individual's eligibility to receive benefits within 15 days of the mailing date of the quarterly billing of benefit charges.

The employer filed its appeal of the statement of charges within the time period prescribed by the lowa Employment Security Law because it did not receive the notice of claim giving it an opportunity to protest the claimant's receipt of benefits chargeable to its account. The administrative law judge determines that the employer's failure to file a proper appeal in the second quarter is not fatal to its subsequent appeals, given the employer's reasonable efforts to contact the agency, the raging global pandemic overshadowing every aspect of life at the time, and their compliance with all other steps of the process. The employer filed the appeal to the third quarter and fourth quarter statements of charges within thirty days making the appeal timely. The claimant has requalified for benefits since the separation from this employer by earning ten times the weekly benefit amount in insured wages following the separation. See lowa Code §§ 96.5(1)g and 96.5(2)a. Accordingly, benefits are allowed and the account of the employer shall not be charged.

DECISION:

The November 9, 2020, reference 00, statement of charges for the third quarter of 2020 is modified in favor of the appellant, which will appear as a credit to the employer's account on a future statement of charges. The employer has filed a timely appeal from that statement of charges, as the notice of claim was not received. The claimant has requalified for benefits since the separation. Benefits are allowed, provided the claimant is otherwise eligible. The account of the employer shall not be charged and a credit shall be issued on a future statement of charges.

Elizabeth A. Johnson Administrative Law Judge

November 22, 2022

Decision Dated and Mailed

APPEAL RIGHTS. If you disagree with the decision, you or any interested party may:

1. Appeal to the Employment Appeal Board within fifteen (15) days of the date under the judge's signature by submitting a written appeal via mail, fax, or online to:

Employment Appeal Board 4th Floor – Lucas Building Des Moines, Iowa 50319 Fax: (515)281-7191 Online: eab.iowa.gov

The appeal period will be extended to the next business day if the last day to appeal falls on a weekend or a legal holiday.

AN APPEAL TO THE BOARD SHALL STATE CLEARLY:

- 1) The name, address, and social security number of the claimant.
- 2) A reference to the decision from which the appeal is taken.
- 3) That an appeal from such decision is being made and such appeal is signed.
- 4) The grounds upon which such appeal is based.

An Employment Appeal Board decision is final agency action. If a party disagrees with the Employment Appeal Board decision, they may then file a petition for judicial review in district court.

2. If no one files an appeal of the judge's decision with the Employment Appeal Board within fifteen (15) days, the decision becomes final agency action, and you have the option to file a petition for judicial review in District Court within thirty (30) days after the decision becomes final. Additional information on how to file a petition can be found at lowa Code §17A.19, which is online at https://www.legis.iowa.gov/docs/code/17A.19.pdf or by contacting the District Court Clerk of Court https://www.iowacourts.gov/iowa-courts/court-directory/.

Note to Parties: YOU MAY REPRESENT yourself in the appeal or obtain a lawyer or other interested party to do so provided there is no expense to Workforce Development. If you wish to be represented by a lawyer, you may obtain the services of either a private attorney or one whose services are paid for with public funds.

Note to Claimant: It is important that you file your weekly claim as directed, while this appeal is pending, to protect your continuing right to benefits.

SERVICE INFORMATION:

A true and correct copy of this decision was mailed to each of the parties listed.

DERECHOS DE APELACIÓN. Si no está de acuerdo con la decisión, usted o cualquier parte interesada puede:

1. Apelar a la Junta de Apelaciones de Empleo dentro de los quince (15) días de la fecha bajo la firma del juez presentando una apelación por escrito por correo, fax o en línea a:

Employment Appeal Board 4th Floor – Lucas Building Des Moines, Iowa 50319 Fax: (515)281-7191 En línea: eab.iowa.gov

El período de apelación se extenderá hasta el siguiente día hábil si el último día para apelar cae en fin de semana o día feriado legal.

UNA APELACIÓN A LA JUNTA DEBE ESTABLECER CLARAMENTE:

- 1) El nombre, dirección y número de seguro social del reclamante.
- 2) Una referencia a la decisión de la que se toma la apelación.
- 3) Que se interponga recurso de apelación contra tal decisión y se firme dicho recurso.
- 4) Los fundamentos en que se funda dicho recurso.

Una decisión de la Junta de Apelaciones de Empleo es una acción final de la agencia. Si una de las partes no está de acuerdo con la decisión de la Junta de Apelación de Empleo, puede presentar una petición de revisión judicial en el tribunal de distrito.

2. Si nadie presenta una apelación de la decisión del juez ante la Junta de Apelaciones Laborales dentro de los quince (15) días, la decisión se convierte en acción final de la agencia y usted tiene la opción de presentar una petición de revisión judicial en el Tribunal de Distrito dentro de los treinta (30) días después de que la decisión adquiera firmeza. Puede encontrar información adicional sobre cómo presentar una petición en el Código de Iowa §17A.19, que se encuentra en línea en https://www.legis.iowa.gov/docs/code/17A.19.pdf o comunicándose con el Tribunal de Distrito Secretario del tribunal https:///www.iowacourts.gov/iowa-courts/court-directory/.

Nota para las partes: USTED PUEDE REPRESENTARSE en la apelación u obtener un abogado u otra parte interesada para que lo haga, siempre que no haya gastos para Workforce Development. Si desea ser representado por un abogado, puede obtener los servicios de un abogado privado o uno cuyos servicios se paguen con fondos públicos.

Nota para el reclamante: es importante que presente su reclamo semanal según las instrucciones, mientras esta apelación está pendiente, para proteger su derecho continuo a los beneficios.

SERVICIO DE INFORMACIÓN:

Se envió por correo una copia fiel y correcta de esta decisión a cada una de las partes enumeradas.