IN THE IOWA ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS DIVISION UNEMPLOYMENT INSURANCE APPEALS BUREAU

CHRISTINE R MEDICI

Claimant

APPEAL 23A-UI-07970-SN-T

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE DECISION

HY-VEE INC

Employer

OC: 07/16/23

Claimant: Respondent (2)

Iowa Code § 96.5(2)a – Discharge for Misconduct

Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.32(1)a – Discharge for Misconduct

Iowa Code § 96.3(7) – Recovery of Benefit Overpayment

Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.10 – Recovery of Benefit Overpayment

STATEMENT OF THE CASE:

The employer, Hy-Vee Inc., filed an appeal from the August 11, 2023, (reference 01) unemployment insurance decision that granted benefits based upon the conclusion she was discharged, but no misconduct was shown. The parties were properly notified of the hearing. A telephone hearing was held on September 5, 2023. The claimant participated and testified. The employer participated through Assistant Store Manager Andrew Hill and Human Resources Manager Lauri Spilman. Official notice was taken of the administrative records.

ISSUES:

Was the claimant discharged for disqualifying job-related misconduct?

Whether the claimant has been overpaid benefits? Whether the claimant is excused from repayment of benefits due to the employer's non-participation?

FINDINGS OF FACT:

Having reviewed all of the evidence in the record, the administrative law judge finds:

The claimant worked part-time for the employer as a convenience store clerk from November 15, 2022, until she separated from employment on April 10, 2023, when she quit. The claimant reported directly to Assistant Manager Andrew Hill.

On April 10, 2023, the claimant and Mr. Hill were the only two employees working in the convenience store. Mr. Hill asked the claimant what took her two and a half hours to do given that she had not been performing closing tasks. The claimant informed him that she had filled the cappuccino machine because a customer asked what was wrong with it. Mr. Hill said that he specifically told her not to do extra work and labeled several of the things she had done as extra. The claimant took offense because she had done everything she had been directed to do earlier in the night. The claimant said, "I'm done." The claimant walked out of the store at 8:45

p.m. The claimant took her personal items with her. Mr. Hill did not ask the claimant to leave. He continued performing the remaining duties in her absence.

On April 11, 2023, the claimant informed management at the grocery store the circumstances that occurred that night. She was informed to write them down on paper and to give them to the human resources department.

On April 13, 2023, the claimant provided this written statement to Human Resources Manager Laurie Spilman. The employer provided a copy of this written statement. (Exhibit 1) Ms. Spilman informed the claimant that she had already separated from employment when she quit on April 10, 2023.

The following section of the findings of fact display the findings necessary to resolve the overpayment issue:

The claimant has not received benefits after separating from this employer.

REASONING AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW:

The administrative law judge concludes claimant's separation from the employment was without good cause attributable to the employer.

Iowa Code section 96.5(1) provides:

An individual shall be disqualified for benefits:

1. Voluntary quitting. If the individual has left work voluntarily without good cause attributable to the individual's employer, if so found by the department.

The claimant has the burden of proving that the voluntary leaving was for good cause attributable to the employer. Iowa Code § 96.6(2). "Good cause" for leaving employment must be that which is reasonable to the average person, not the overly sensitive individual or the claimant in particular. *Uniweld Products v. Indus. Relations Comm'n*, 277 So.2d 827 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. 1973). A voluntary leaving of employment requires an intention to terminate the employment relationship accompanied by an overt act of carrying out that intention. *Local Lodge #1426 v. Wilson Trailer*, 289 N.W.2d 608, 612 (lowa 1980).

The claimant quit. The administrative law judge recognizes that the words, "I'm done," do not explain everything. The claimant contends she only needed to calm down. But her actions of leaving the store with her possessions before the end of her shift signaled the full intent. The claimant maybe needed to calm down, but only because she felt worse for it afterwards. That is understandable, but just because she had second thoughts after completing the act does not make her intent less than quitting on April 10, 2023.

Since it is a quit, the claimant bears the burden of showing that quit of for a cause attributable to the employer.

Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.26(4) provides:

Voluntary quit with good cause attributable to the employer and separations not considered to be voluntary quits. The following are reasons for a claimant leaving employment with good cause attributable to the employer:

(4) The claimant left due to intolerable or detrimental working conditions.

Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.25(21) and (22) provide:

Voluntary quit without good cause. In general, a voluntary quit means discontinuing the employment because the employee no longer desires to remain in the relationship of an employee with the employer from whom the employee has separated. The employer has the burden of proving that the claimant is disqualified for benefits pursuant to lowa Code section 96.5. However, the claimant has the initial burden to produce evidence that the claimant is not disqualified for benefits in cases involving lowa Code section 96.5, subsection (1), paragraphs "a" through "i," and subsection 10. The following reasons for a voluntary quit shall be presumed to be without good cause attributable to the employer:

- (22) The claimant left because of a personality conflict with the supervisor.
- (33) The claimant left because such claimant felt that the job performance was not to the satisfaction of the employer; provided, the employer had not requested the claimant to leave and continued work was available.

The standard of what a reasonable person would have believed under the circumstances is applied in determining whether a claimant left work voluntarily with good cause attributable to the employer. O'Brien v. Employment Appeal Bd., 494 N.W.2d 660 (lowa 1993).

The claimant quit because she felt like her performance was not to the satisfaction of the employer on April 10, 2023. However, the employer did not ask her to leave and continuing work was available. This reason is disqualifying under lowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.25(33).

The administrative law judge is not without empathy to the claimant's frustration with the perception that she was moving slowly or not an effective worker. The law requires more than this for the work environment to be intolerable and for her quit to be qualifying. The world is filled with workers who feel unappreciated. Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.26(4)

While claimant's leaving may have been based upon good personal reasons, it was not for a good-cause reason attributable to the employer according to lowa law. Benefits are denied.

DECISION:

The August 11, 2023, (reference 01) unemployment insurance decision is REVERSED. The claimant voluntarily left her employment without good cause attributable to the employer. Benefits are withheld until such time as she has worked in and been paid wages for insured work equal to ten times her weekly benefit amount, provided she is otherwise eligible.



Sean M. Nelson Administrative Law Judge II

September 8, 2023
Decision Dated and Mailed

smn/scn

APPEAL RIGHTS. If you disagree with the decision, you or any interested party may:

1. Appeal to the Employment Appeal Board within fifteen (15) days of the date under the judge's signature by submitting a written appeal via mail, fax, or online to:

Employment Appeal Board 4th Floor – Lucas Building Des Moines, Iowa 50319 Fax: (515)281-7191 Online: eab.iowa.gov

The appeal period will be extended to the next business day if the last day to appeal falls on a weekend or a legal holiday.

AN APPEAL TO THE BOARD SHALL STATE CLEARLY:

- 1) The name, address, and social security number of the claimant.
- 2) A reference to the decision from which the appeal is taken.
- 3) That an appeal from such decision is being made and such appeal is signed.
- 4) The grounds upon which such appeal is based.

An Employment Appeal Board decision is final agency action. If a party disagrees with the Employment Appeal Board decision, they may then file a petition for judicial review in district court.

2. If no one files an appeal of the judge's decision with the Employment Appeal Board within fifteen (15) days, the decision becomes final agency action, and you have the option to file a petition for judicial review in District Court within thirty (30) days after the decision becomes final. Additional information on how to file a petition can be found at Iowa Code §17A.19, which is online at https://www.legis.iowa.gov/docs/code/17A.19.pdf or by contacting the District Court Clerk of Court https://www.iowacourts.gov/iowa-courts/court-directory/.

Note to Parties: YOU MAY REPRESENT yourself in the appeal or obtain a lawyer or other interested party to do so provided there is no expense to Workforce Development. If you wish to be represented by a lawyer, you may obtain the services of either a private attorney or one whose services are paid for with public funds.

Note to Claimant: It is important that you file your weekly claim as directed, while this appeal is pending, to protect your continuing right to benefits.

SERVICE INFORMATION:

A true and correct copy of this decision was mailed to each of the parties listed.

DERECHOS DE APELACIÓN. Si no está de acuerdo con la decisión, usted o cualquier parte interesada puede:

1. Apelar a la Junta de Apelaciones de Empleo dentro de los quince (15) días de la fecha bajo la firma del juez presentando una apelación por escrito por correo, fax o en línea a:

Employment Appeal Board 4th Floor – Lucas Building Des Moines, Iowa 50319 Fax: (515)281-7191 En línea: eab.iowa.gov

El período de apelación se extenderá hasta el siguiente día hábil si el último día para apelar cae en fin de semana o día feriado legal.

UNA APELACIÓN A LA JUNTA DEBE ESTABLECER CLARAMENTE:

- 1) El nombre, dirección y número de seguro social del reclamante.
- 2) Una referencia a la decisión de la que se toma la apelación.
- 3) Que se interponga recurso de apelación contra tal decisión y se firme dicho recurso.
- 4) Los fundamentos en que se funda dicho recurso.

Una decisión de la Junta de Apelaciones de Empleo es una acción final de la agencia. Si una de las partes no está de acuerdo con la decisión de la Junta de Apelación de Empleo, puede presentar una petición de revisión judicial en el tribunal de distrito.

2. Si nadie presenta una apelación de la decisión del juez ante la Junta de Apelaciones Laborales dentro de los quince (15) días, la decisión se convierte en acción final de la agencia y usted tiene la opción de presentar una petición de revisión judicial en el Tribunal de Distrito dentro de los treinta (30) días después de que la decisión adquiera firmeza. Puede encontrar información adicional sobre cómo presentar una petición en el Código de Iowa §17A.19, que se encuentra en línea en https://www.legis.iowa.gov/docs/code/17A.19.pdf o comunicándose con el Tribunal de Distrito Secretario del tribunal https://www.iowacourts.gov/iowa-courts/court-directory/.

Nota para las partes: USTED PUEDE REPRESENTARSE en la apelación u obtener un abogado u otra parte interesada para que lo haga, siempre que no haya gastos para Workforce Development. Si desea ser representado por un abogado, puede obtener los servicios de un abogado privado o uno cuyos servicios se paguen con fondos públicos.

Nota para el reclamante: es importante que presente su reclamo semanal según las instrucciones, mientras esta apelación está pendiente, para proteger su derecho continuo a los beneficios.

SERVICIO DE INFORMACIÓN:

Se envió por correo una copia fiel y correcta de esta decisión a cada una de las partes enumeradas.