# IN THE IOWA ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS DIVISION UNEMPLOYMENT INSURANCE APPEALS BUREAU

JOHN M WEST<br/>ClaimantAPPEAL 24A-UI-03075-AR-T<br/>ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE<br/>DECISIONHUMAN CAPITAL SOLUTIONS INC<br/>EmployerOC: 02/25/24<br/>Claimant: Appellant (1)

Iowa Code § 96.5(1) – Voluntary Quitting

# STATEMENT OF THE CASE:

On March 19, 2024, the claimant filed an appeal from the March 15, 2024, (reference 03) unemployment insurance decision that denied benefits based on the determination that claimant voluntarily quit employment without a showing of good cause attributable to the employer. The parties were properly notified about the hearing. A telephone hearing was held on April 10, 2024. Claimant, John M. West, participated. Employer, Human Capital Solutions Inc., participated through HR Manager Delaney Dehnke and HR Manager Erin Brown. Employer's Exhibits 1 through 10 were admitted.

### **ISSUES:**

Was the claimant discharged for disqualifying job-related misconduct? Has the claimant been overpaid unemployment insurance benefits, and if so, can the repayment of those benefits to the agency be waived? Can charges to the employer's account be waived?

### FINDINGS OF FACT:

Having reviewed all of the evidence in the record, the administrative law judge finds: Claimant began working for employer on December 5, 2023. Claimant last worked as a full-time HR client consultant. Claimant was separated from employment on February 23, 2024, when he resigned.

Claimant questioned the employer's decision to hire him from the beginning of his employment. He did not feel that he had the qualifications to perform the duties of the position. However, when he asked why he had been hired, he was told that he was eager and could be trained.

Claimant made a number of mistakes for a number of different clients during his tenure. He found these mistakes to be frustrating and embarrassing. He always told his supervisors about these issues. He was never told that he was not meeting the employer's expectations, that his

mistakes were a larger issue, or that he was in danger of losing his job. He had also not been told that he had the choice between resigning or being terminated. Instead, the employer gave him generally positive feedback. Claimant did not ask for additional training or express his concerns about his abilities in the position to anyone at the employer. He did not tell anyone at the employer that his concerns were causing him to consider quitting.

On February 23, 2024, claimant emailed Brown and Dehnke and resigned effective immediately. Claimant did this because he did not think that things would improve based on his experience to that point and his assessment of the employer's environment. Had claimant not quit, he would have been offered continued work.

# REASONING AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW:

For the reasons that follow, the administrative law judge concludes claimant's separation from the employment was without good cause attributable to the employer.

lowa Code section 96.5(1) provides:

An individual shall be disqualified for benefits:

1. Voluntary quitting. If the individual has left work voluntarily without good cause attributable to the individual's employer, if so found by the department.

Iowa Admin. Code r. 871—24.25(33) provides:

Voluntary quit without good cause. In general, a voluntary quit means discontinuing the employment because the employee no longer desires to remain in the relationship of an employee with the employer from whom the employee has separated. The employer has the burden of proving that the claimant is disqualified for benefits pursuant to Iowa Code section 96.5. However, the claimant has the initial burden to produce evidence that the claimant is not disqualified for benefits in cases involving Iowa Code section 96.5, subsection (1), paragraphs "a" through "i," and subsection 10. The following reasons for a voluntary quit shall be presumed to be without good cause attributable to the employer:

(33) The claimant left because such claimant felt that the job performance was not to the satisfaction of the employer; provided, the employer had not requested the claimant to leave and continued work was available.

A voluntary quitting means discontinuing the employment because the employee no longer desires to remain in the relationship of an employee with the employer and requires an intention to terminate the employment. *Wills v. Emp't Appeal Bd.*, 447 N.W. 2d 137, 138 (Iowa 1989). A voluntary leaving of employment requires an intention to terminate the employment relationship accompanied by an overt act of carrying out that intention. *Local Lodge #1426 v. Wilson Trailer*, 289 N.W.2d 608, 612 (Iowa 1980); *Peck v. Emp't Appeal Bd.*, 492 N.W.2d 438 (Iowa Ct. App. 1992).

Claimant has the burden of proving that the voluntary leaving was for good cause attributable to the employer. Iowa Code § 96.6(2). "Good cause" for leaving employment must be that which is reasonable to the average person, not the overly sensitive individual or the claimant in particular. *Uniweld Products v. Indus. Relations Comm'n*, 277 So.2d 827 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App.

1973). The standard of what a reasonable person would have believed under the circumstances is applied in determining whether a claimant left work voluntarily with good cause attributable to the employer. *O'Brien v. Emp't Appeal Bd.*, 494 N.W.2d 660 (lowa 1993).

Claimant had been given no indication by the employer that his job performance was not meeting its expectations. His employment had not been threatened, and he had not been informed that he would be terminated if he did not resign. Claimant resigned because he assessed his job performance as lacking, but not because of any such indication from the employer. Accordingly, claimant's reasons for leaving may have been good personal reasons, but they do not constitute good-cause reasons attributable to the employer. Benefits are denied.

# **DECISION:**

The March 15, 2024, (reference 03) unemployment insurance decision is AFFIRMED. Claimant voluntarily left the employment without good cause attributable to the employer. Benefits are withheld until such time as he has worked in and been paid wages for insured work equal to ten times his weekly benefit amount, provided he is otherwise eligible.

AuDRe

Alexis D. Rowe Administrative Law Judge

<u>April 12, 2024</u> Decision Dated and Mailed

AR/jkb

APPEAL RIGHTS. If you disagree with the decision, you or any interested party may:

1. Appeal to the Employment Appeal Board within fifteen (15) days of the date under the judge's signature by submitting a written appeal via mail, fax, or online to:

#### Iowa Employment Appeal Board 6200 Park Avenue Suite 100 Des Moines, Iowa 50321 Fax: (515)281-7191 Online: eab.iowa.gov

The appeal period will be extended to the next business day if the last day to appeal falls on a weekend or a legal holiday.

#### AN APPEAL TO THE BOARD SHALL STATE CLEARLY:

1) The name, address, and social security number of the claimant.

2) A reference to the decision from which the appeal is taken.

3) That an appeal from such decision is being made and such appeal is signed.

4) The grounds upon which such appeal is based.

An Employment Appeal Board decision is final agency action. If a party disagrees with the Employment Appeal Board decision, they may then file a petition for judicial review in district court.

2. If no one files an appeal of the judge's decision with the Employment Appeal Board within fifteen (15) days, the decision becomes final agency action, and you have the option to file a petition for judicial review in District Court within thirty (30) days after the decision becomes final. Additional information on how to file a petition can be found at lowa Code §17A.19, which is online at https://www.legis.iowa.gov/docs/code/17A.19.pdf or by contacting the District Court Clerk of Court\_https://www.iowacourts.gov/iowa-courts/court-directory/.

**Note to Parties:** YOU MAY REPRESENT yourself in the appeal or obtain a lawyer or other interested party to do so provided there is no expense to Workforce Development. If you wish to be represented by a lawyer, you may obtain the services of either a private attorney or one whose services are paid for with public funds.

**Note to Claimant:** It is important that you file your weekly claim as directed, while this appeal is pending, to protect your continuing right to benefits.

### SERVICE INFORMATION:

A true and correct copy of this decision was mailed to each of the parties listed.

**DERECHOS DE APELACIÓN.** Si no está de acuerdo con la decisión, usted o cualquier parte interesada puede:

1. Apelar a la Junta de Apelaciones de Empleo dentro de los quince (15) días de la fecha bajo la firma del juez presentando una apelación por escrito por correo, fax o en línea a:

#### Iowa Employment Appeal Board 6200 Park Avenue Suite 100 Des Moines, Iowa 50321 Fax: (515)281-7191 En línea: eab.iowa.gov

El período de apelación se extenderá hasta el siguiente día hábil si el último día para apelar cae en fin de semana o día feriado legal.

UNA APELACIÓN A LA JUNTA DEBE ESTABLECER CLARAMENTE:

- 1) El nombre, dirección y número de seguro social del reclamante.
- 2) Una referencia a la decisión de la que se toma la apelación.
- 3) Que se interponga recurso de apelación contra tal decisión y se firme dicho recurso.

4) Los fundamentos en que se funda dicho recurso.

Una decisión de la Junta de Apelaciones de Empleo es una acción final de la agencia. Si una de las partes no está de acuerdo con la decisión de la Junta de Apelación de Empleo, puede presentar una petición de revisión judicial en el tribunal de distrito.

2. Si nadie presenta una apelación de la decisión del juez ante la Junta de Apelaciones Laborales dentro de los quince (15) días, la decisión se convierte en acción final de la agencia y usted tiene la opción de presentar una petición de revisión judicial en el Tribunal de Distrito dentro de los treinta (30) días después de que la decisión adquiera firmeza. Puede encontrar información adicional sobre cómo presentar una petición en el Código de Iowa §17A.19, que se encuentra en línea en https://www.legis.iowa.gov/docs/code/17A.19.pdf o comunicándose con el Tribunal de Distrito Secretario del tribunal https:///www.iowacourts.gov/iowa-courts/court-directory/.

**Nota para las partes:** USTED PUEDE REPRESENTARSE en la apelación u obtener un abogado u otra parte interesada para que lo haga, siempre que no haya gastos para Workforce Development. Si desea ser representado por un abogado, puede obtener los servicios de un abogado privado o uno cuyos servicios se paguen con fondos públicos.

**Nota para el reclamante:** es importante que presente su reclamo semanal según las instrucciones, mientras esta apelación está pendiente, para proteger su derecho continuo a los beneficios.

#### SERVICIO DE INFORMACIÓN:

Se envió por correo una copia fiel y correcta de esta decisión a cada una de las partes enumeradas.