

**IOWA WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT
UNEMPLOYMENT INSURANCE APPEALS**

TONYA L ALBIZO
Claimant

PRO LINES INC
Employer

APPEAL 18A-UI-06425-DG-T

**ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE
DECISION**

**OC: 11/26/17
Claimant: Appellant (1)**

Iowa Code § 96.5(1) – Voluntary Quitting

STATEMENT OF THE CASE:

Claimant filed an appeal from a decision of a representative dated June 4, 2018, (reference 04) that held claimant ineligible for unemployment insurance benefits. After due notice, a hearing was scheduled for and held on June 25, 2018. Claimant participated. Employer participated by John Bartlett, President. Claimant's Exhibit A was admitted into evidence.

ISSUE:

The issue in this matter is whether claimant quit for good cause attributable to employer?

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The administrative law judge, having heard the testimony and considered all of the evidence in the record, finds: Claimant last worked for employer on May 3, 2018. Claimant resigned from the employment on that date because she was dissatisfied with her work environment.

Claimant began working for employer on March 12, 2018. Claimant was told at the time of hire that she would be a salaried employee, and that she was not in a managerial position. She was also told that she would be performing different tasks depending on the work that needed to be done. Employer does not have many employees, and each employee was expected to fill in as needed.

On May 3, 2018, claimant came into work and she saw that the chair she had been using at her desk had been removed. There was a note on a chair at the desk which stated that claimant should be at the retail store. Claimant did not believe she should be spending most of her time at the retail store. She had been hired to work on outside sales, customer retention, and as a project coordinator. Claimant was also unhappy with the cleanliness of employer's workplace, and she did not feel she should have to clean at work because she was not hired as a custodian.

Claimant decided she should leave the employment on May 3, 2018. Claimant was unhappy with the cleanliness of the workplace, and she did not like the type of work she was doing. Her salary and hours remained the same and she had not been demoted, but she thought she would be working in sales and customer retention. Claimant informed the employer that she

was resigning on that date without giving any notice. There was continuing work available to claimant at the time of the separation.

REASONING AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW:

The administrative law judge holds that the evidence has failed to establish that claimant voluntarily quit for good cause attributable to employer when claimant terminated the employment relationship because she was dissatisfied with her work environment.

Iowa Code section 96.5(1) provides:

An individual shall be disqualified for benefits:

1. *Voluntary quitting.* If the individual has left work voluntarily without good cause attributable to the individual's employer, if so found by the department.

Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.25(21) provides:

Voluntary quit without good cause. In general, a voluntary quit means discontinuing the employment because the employee no longer desires to remain in the relationship of an employee with the employer from whom the employee has separated. The employer has the burden of proving that the claimant is disqualified for benefits pursuant to Iowa Code section 96.5. However, the claimant has the initial burden to produce evidence that the claimant is not disqualified for benefits in cases involving Iowa Code section 96.5, subsection (1), paragraphs "a" through "i," and subsection 10. The following reasons for a voluntary quit shall be presumed to be without good cause attributable to the employer:

(21) The claimant left because of dissatisfaction with the work environment.

Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.25(22) provides:

Voluntary quit without good cause. In general, a voluntary quit means discontinuing the employment because the employee no longer desires to remain in the relationship of an employee with the employer from whom the employee has separated. The employer has the burden of proving that the claimant is disqualified for benefits pursuant to Iowa Code section 96.5. However, the claimant has the initial burden to produce evidence that the claimant is not disqualified for benefits in cases involving Iowa Code section 96.5, subsection (1), paragraphs "a" through "i," and subsection 10. The following reasons for a voluntary quit shall be presumed to be without good cause attributable to the employer:

(22) The claimant left because of a personality conflict with the supervisor.

Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.25(27) provides:

Voluntary quit without good cause. In general, a voluntary quit means discontinuing the employment because the employee no longer desires to remain in the relationship of an employee with the employer from whom the employee has separated. The employer has the burden of proving that the claimant is disqualified for benefits pursuant to Iowa Code section 96.5. However, the claimant has the initial burden to produce evidence that the claimant is not disqualified for benefits in cases involving Iowa Code section 96.5, subsection (1), paragraphs "a" through "i," and subsection 10. The following reasons for a voluntary quit shall be presumed to be without good cause attributable to the employer:

(27) The claimant left rather than perform the assigned work as instructed.

It is the duty of the administrative law judge as the trier of fact in this case, to determine the credibility of witnesses, weigh the evidence and decide the facts in issue. *Arndt v. City of LeClaire*, 728 N.W.2d 389, 394-395 (Iowa 2007). The administrative law judge may believe all, part or none of any witness's testimony. *State v. Holtz*, 548 N.W.2d 162, 163 (Iowa App. 1996). In assessing the credibility of witnesses, the administrative law judge should consider the evidence using his or her own observations, common sense and experience. *Id.* In determining the facts, and deciding what testimony to believe, the fact finder may consider the following factors: whether the testimony is reasonable and consistent with other believable evidence; whether a witness has made inconsistent statements; the witness's appearance, conduct, age, intelligence, memory and knowledge of the facts; and the witness's interest in the trial, their motive, candor, bias and prejudice. *Id.*

Claimant has the burden of proving that the voluntary leaving was for good cause attributable to the employer. Iowa Code § 96.6(2). A voluntary leaving of employment requires an intention to terminate the employment relationship accompanied by an overt act of carrying out that intention. *Local Lodge #1426 v. Wilson Trailer*, 289 N.W.2d 608, 612 (Iowa 1980).

Individuals who leave their employment due to disparate treatment are considered to have left work due to intolerable or detrimental working conditions and their leaving is deemed to be for good cause attributable to the employer. The test is whether a reasonable person would have quit under the circumstances. See *Aalbers v. Iowa Dep't of Job Serv.*, 431 N.W.2d 330 (Iowa 1988) and *O'Brien v. Emp't Appeal Bd.*, 494 N.W.2d 660 (Iowa 1993).

While claimant's leaving the employment may have been based upon good personal reasons, it was not for a good-cause reason attributable to the employer. Benefits must be denied.

DECISION:

The decision of the representative dated June 4, 2018, (reference 04) is affirmed. Unemployment insurance benefits shall be withheld until claimant has worked in and been paid wages for insured work equal to ten times claimant's weekly benefit amount, provided claimant is otherwise eligible.

Duane L. Golden
Administrative Law Judge

Decision Dated and Mailed

dlg/scn