

**IN THE IOWA ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS DIVISION
UNEMPLOYMENT INSURANCE APPEALS BUREAU**

STACEY G THOMAS
Claimant

BLAINE HOLZ
Employer

APPEAL 24A-UI-00932-SN-T
**ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE
DECISION**

OC: 12/10/23
Claimant: Appellant (1-R)

Iowa Code section 96.1A(37) – Total and Partial Unemployment
Iowa Code § 96.4(3) – Ability to and Availability for Work
Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.23(26) – Availability Disqualifications Same Hours and Wages
Iowa Code § 96.7(2)a(2) – Same Base Period Employment

STATEMENT OF THE CASE:

The claimant, Stacey G. Thomas, filed an appeal from the January 17, 2024 (reference 01) unemployment insurance decision that denied benefits effective December 10, 2023, reasoning she was receiving the same hours and wages as in his original contract of hire. The parties were properly notified of the hearing. A telephone hearing was held on February 13, 2024, at 9:00 a.m. The claimant participated. The employer did not participate. No exhibits were admitted. Official notice was taken of the administrative record.

ISSUES:

Whether claimant is totally, partially or temporarily unemployed?

Whether claimant is able to and available for work?

Whether claimant is still employed at the same hours and wages?

Whether employer's account is subject to charge?

FINDINGS OF FACT:

Having reviewed all of the evidence in the record, the administrative law judge finds:

The claimant began employment with the employer as a part-time caretaker on January 25, 2005. The claimant is the grandmother of Blaine Holz. Mr. Holz requires caretaking due to his disabilities. The claimant's regular schedule varied from week to week. Mr. Holz' parents hired the claimant to take care of him when work was needed. Her rate of pay was \$15.00. The claimant continues to be employed part-time with this employer.

On December 10, 2023, the claimant filed an original claim for unemployment insurance benefits. Her weekly benefit amount is \$354.00. The claimant filed this claim because she separated from another part-time employer, IKAN Marketing, with fluctuating variable wages.

The claimant began working for Ameripride Travel Center Incorporated the week ending December 30, 2023.

	2022/4	2023/1	2023/2	2023/3	2023/4
IKAN Marketing INC	\$3,971.00	\$2,940.00	\$3,700.00	\$2,243.00	\$3,084.00
Blaine Holz	\$1,968.00		\$2,042.00	\$4,844.00	\$ 942.00
Ameripride Travel Center Inc					\$ 74.00

REASONING AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW:

The administrative law judge concludes the claimant is not partially unemployed because she was receiving the same hours and wages from this employer as contemplated at the time of her hire. Benefits are denied.

The decision in this case rests, at least in part, on the credibility of the witnesses. It is the duty of the administrative law judge as the trier of fact in this case, to determine the credibility of witnesses, weigh the evidence and decide the facts in issue. *Arndt v. City of LeClaire*, 728 N.W.2d 389, 394-395 (Iowa 2007). The administrative law judge may believe all, part or none of any witness’s testimony. *State v. Holtz*, 548 N.W.2d 162, 163 (Iowa App. 1996). In assessing the credibility of witnesses, the administrative law judge should consider the evidence using his or her own observations, common sense and experience. *Id.* In determining the facts, and deciding what testimony to believe, the fact finder may consider the following factors: whether the testimony is reasonable and consistent with other believable evidence; whether a witness has made inconsistent statements; the witness's appearance, conduct, age, intelligence, memory and knowledge of the facts; and the witness's interest in the trial, their motive, candor, bias and prejudice. *Id.*

After assessing the credibility of the witnesses who testified during the hearing, reviewing the exhibits submitted by the parties, considering the applicable factors listed above, and using his own common sense and experience, the administrative law judge finds the claimant’s testimony not credible in the following ways.

First, the claimant testified that her employment with this employer ended in September 2023. Specifically, she says that was the last day she cared for him in her appeal. According to her testimony, Mr. Holz’ parents lost custody shortly after this last visit.

As illustrated above in the table, the claimant continued to receive wages into the fourth quarter. There is no means of reconciling the claimant’s allegation that her employment ended in

mid-September 2023, with what is seen in the administrative records as reported wages for the employer, Blaine Holz, into the fourth quarter.

Second, the claimant testified that her employment at IKAN Marketing Incorporated was full-time. As illustrated above in the table, the claimant received varying wages per quarter from this employer.

Iowa Code section 96.1A(37) provides:

Totally unemployed”, “partially unemployed”, and “temporarily unemployed.

a. An individual shall be deemed "totally unemployed" in any week with respect to which no wages are payable to the individual and during which the individual performs no services.

b. An individual shall be deemed “partially unemployed” in any week in which either of the following apply:

(1) While employed at the individual's then regular job, the individual works less than the regular full-time week and in which the individual earns less than the individual's weekly benefit amount plus fifteen dollars.

(2) The individual, having been separated from the individual's regular job, earns at odd jobs less than the individual's weekly benefit amount plus fifteen dollars.

c. An individual shall be deemed “temporarily unemployed” if for a period, verified by the department, not to exceed four consecutive weeks, the individual is unemployed due to a plant shutdown, vacation, inventory, lack of work or emergency from the individual's regular job or trade in which the individual worked full-time and will again work full-time, if the individual's employment, although temporarily suspended, has not been terminated.

Iowa Code section 96.4(3)a provides:

An unemployed individual shall be eligible to receive benefits with respect to any week only if the department finds that:

3. a. The individual is able to work, is available for work, and is earnestly and actively seeking work. This subsection is waived if the individual is deemed partially unemployed, while employed at the individual's regular job, as defined in section 96.1A, subsection 37, paragraph "b", subparagraph (1), or temporarily unemployed as defined in section 96.1A, subsection 37, paragraph "c". The work search requirements of this subsection and the disqualification requirement for failure to apply for, or to accept suitable work of section 96.5, subsection 3 are waived if the individual is not disqualified for benefits under section 96.5, subsection 1, paragraph "h".

Iowa Code section 96.7(2)a(2) provides:

2. Contribution rates based on benefit experience.

a. (2) The amount of regular benefits plus fifty percent of the amount of extended benefits paid to an eligible individual shall be charged against the account of the employers in the base period in the inverse chronological order in which the employment of the individual occurred.

(a) However, if the individual to whom the benefits are paid is in the employ of a base period employer at the time the individual is receiving the benefits, and the individual is receiving the same employment from the employer that the individual received during the individual's base period, benefits paid to the individual shall not be charged against the account of the employer. This provision applies to both contributory and reimbursable employers, notwithstanding subparagraph (3) and section 96.8, subsection 5.

(b) An employer's account shall not be charged with benefits paid to an individual who left the work of the employer voluntarily without good cause attributable to the employer or to an individual who was discharged for misconduct in connection with the individual's employment, or to an individual who failed without good cause, either to apply for available, suitable work or to accept suitable work with that employer, but shall be charged to the unemployment compensation fund. This paragraph applies to both contributory and reimbursable employers, notwithstanding section 96.8, subsection 5.

(c) The amount of benefits paid to an individual, which is solely due to wage credits considered to be in an individual's base period due to the exclusion and substitution of calendar quarters from the individual's base period under section 96.23, shall be charged against the account of the employer responsible for paying the workers' compensation benefits for temporary total disability or during a healing period under section 85.33, section 85.34, subsection 1, or section 85A.17, or responsible for paying indemnity insurance benefits.

Iowa Admin. R. 871-24.23(26) provides:

Availability disqualifications. The following are reasons for a claimant being disqualified for being unavailable for work.

(26) Where a claimant is still employed in a part-time job at the same hours and wages as contemplated in the original contract for hire and is not working on a reduced workweek basis different from the contract for hire, such claimant cannot be considered partially unemployed.

The administrative law judge agrees with the representative. The wage records show the claimant received the same fluctuating part-time hours and wages as in her original contract of hire from this employer into the fourth quarter. As a result, the claimant is ineligible due to Iowa Admin. R. 871-24.23(26).

DECISION:

The January 17, 2024 (reference 01) unemployment insurance decision is AFFIRMED. The claimant is not partially unemployed because she is receiving the same hours and wages as in her original contract of hire, which is fluctuating variable part-time work.

REMAND:

The administrative law judge is remanding to the Benefits Bureau the following issued to investigate, in its discretion, with full due process rights to the parties. The issue is regarding the claimant's reported separation date from this employer in September 2023 and the reported wages shown in the fourth quarter of 2023.

A rectangular box containing a handwritten signature in black ink on a light gray background. The signature is cursive and appears to read 'S. Nelson'.

Sean M. Nelson
Administrative Law Judge II
Iowa Department of Inspections & Appeals
Administrative Hearings Division – UI Appeals Bureau

February 20, 2024
Decision Dated and Mailed

smn/scn

APPEAL RIGHTS. If you disagree with the decision, you or any interested party may:

1. Appeal to the Employment Appeal Board within fifteen (15) days of the date under the judge's signature by submitting a written appeal via mail, fax, or online to:

**Employment Appeal Board
6200 Park Avenue Suite 100
Des Moines, Iowa 50321
Fax: (515)281-7191
Online: eab.iowa.gov**

The appeal period will be extended to the next business day if the last day to appeal falls on a weekend or a legal holiday.

AN APPEAL TO THE BOARD SHALL STATE CLEARLY:

- 1) The name, address, and social security number of the claimant.
- 2) A reference to the decision from which the appeal is taken.
- 3) That an appeal from such decision is being made and such appeal is signed.
- 4) The grounds upon which such appeal is based.

An Employment Appeal Board decision is final agency action. If a party disagrees with the Employment Appeal Board decision, they may then file a petition for judicial review in district court.

2. If no one files an appeal of the judge's decision with the Employment Appeal Board within fifteen (15) days, the decision becomes final agency action, and you have the option to file a petition for judicial review in District Court within thirty (30) days after the decision becomes final. Additional information on how to file a petition can be found at Iowa Code §17A.19, which is online at <https://www.legis.iowa.gov/docs/code/17A.19.pdf> or by contacting the District Court Clerk of Court <https://www.iowacourts.gov/iowa-courts/court-directory/>.

Note to Parties: YOU MAY REPRESENT yourself in the appeal or obtain a lawyer or other interested party to do so provided there is no expense to Workforce Development. If you wish to be represented by a lawyer, you may obtain the services of either a private attorney or one whose services are paid for with public funds.

Note to Claimant: It is important that you file your weekly claim as directed, while this appeal is pending, to protect your continuing right to benefits.

SERVICE INFORMATION:

A true and correct copy of this decision was mailed to each of the parties listed.

DERECHOS DE APELACIÓN. Si no está de acuerdo con la decisión, usted o cualquier parte interesada puede:

1. Apelar a la Junta de Apelaciones de Empleo dentro de los quince (15) días de la fecha bajo la firma del juez presentando una apelación por escrito por correo, fax o en línea a:

**Employment Appeal Board
6200 Park Avenue Suite 100
Des Moines, Iowa 50321
Fax: (515)281-7191
Online: eab.iowa.gov**

El período de apelación se extenderá hasta el siguiente día hábil si el último día para apelar cae en fin de semana o día feriado legal.

UNA APELACIÓN A LA JUNTA DEBE ESTABLECER CLARAMENTE:

- 1) El nombre, dirección y número de seguro social del reclamante.
- 2) Una referencia a la decisión de la que se toma la apelación.
- 3) Que se interponga recurso de apelación contra tal decisión y se firme dicho recurso.
- 4) Los fundamentos en que se funda dicho recurso.

Una decisión de la Junta de Apelaciones de Empleo es una acción final de la agencia. Si una de las partes no está de acuerdo con la decisión de la Junta de Apelación de Empleo, puede presentar una petición de revisión judicial en el tribunal de distrito.

2. Si nadie presenta una apelación de la decisión del juez ante la Junta de Apelaciones Laborales dentro de los quince (15) días, la decisión se convierte en acción final de la agencia y usted tiene la opción de presentar una petición de revisión judicial en el Tribunal de Distrito dentro de los treinta (30) días después de que la decisión adquiriera firmeza. Puede encontrar información adicional sobre cómo presentar una petición en el Código de Iowa §17A.19, que se encuentra en línea en <https://www.legis.iowa.gov/docs/code/17A.19.pdf> o comunicándose con el Tribunal de Distrito Secretario del tribunal <https://www.iowacourts.gov/iowa-courts/court-directory/>.

Nota para las partes: USTED PUEDE REPRESENTARSE en la apelación u obtener un abogado u otra parte interesada para que lo haga, siempre que no haya gastos para Workforce Development. Si desea ser representado por un abogado, puede obtener los servicios de un abogado privado o uno cuyos servicios se paguen con fondos públicos.

Nota para el reclamante: es importante que presente su reclamo semanal según las instrucciones, mientras esta apelación está pendiente, para proteger su derecho continuo a los beneficios.

SERVICIO DE INFORMACIÓN:

Se envió por correo una copia fiel y correcta de esta decisión a cada una de las partes enumeradas.