IN THE IOWA ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS DIVISION UNEMPLOYMENT INSURANCE APPEALS BUREAU

TAYLOR C DOWD

Claimant

APPEAL NO. 24A-UI-03293-JT-T

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE DECISION

XOXO LLC

Employer

OC: 02/11/24

Claimant: Respondent (1)

Iowa Code Section 96.6-2 - Timeliness of Protest

STATEMENT OF THE CASE:

On March 23, 2024, the employer filed a timely appeal from the March 18, 2024 (reference 02) decision that allowed benefits to the claimant, provided the claimant was otherwise eligible, and that held the employer's account could be charged for benefits, based on the deputy's determination the employer's protest was untimely and therefore could not be considered. After due notice was issued, a hearing was held on April 17, 2024. Taylor Dowd (claimant) did not comply with the hearing notice instructions to call the designated toll-free number at the time of the hearing and did not participate. Lena Christner represented the employer. Exhibits 1 and 2 were received into evidence in reference to the Timeliness of Protest issue. Exhibits 3 and 4 were not relevant to the issue set for hearing and were not admitted into evidence. The administrative law judge took official notice of notice of claim and the employer protest received and processed by lowa Workforce Development.

ISSUES:

Whether the employer's protest of the claim for benefits was timely. Whether there is good cause to deem the employer's late protest as timely.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

Having reviewed the evidence in the record, the administrative law judge finds:

On February 15, 2024, Iowa Workforce Development mailed a notice of claim concerning the above claimant to the employer's Coralville address of record. The notice of claim contained a warning that any protest must be postmarked, faxed or emailed by the due date set forth on the notice, which was February 26, 2024. The notice of claim included instructions and contact information for filing a protest/response by mail, by email and by fax. The United States Postal Service delivered the notice of claim to the employer's Coralville address of record in a timely manner, prior to the protest deadline.

Lena Christner is the business owner. Ms. Christner shares a home with her father. On February 17, 2024, Ms. Christner transported her father to Mayo Clinic in Rochester, Minnesota for tests related to her father's heart health. On February 19, 2024, Ms. Christner's father was

admitted to the hospital. On February 20, 2024, Ms. Christner's father underwent open-heart surgery that included a quadruple bypass. On or about February 21, 2024, Ms. Christner's father underwent a second, emergency surgery. Ms. Christner remained at Mayo Clinic with her father until February 29, 2024, when her father was discharged and Ms. Christner transported her father home to the lowa City/Coralville area.

While Ms. Christner was at Mayo Clinic, she left her manager, Hannah Starr, in charge of business operations but continued to regularly check in with Ms. Starr. On February 22, 2024, Ms. Starr alerted Ms. Christner to receipt of correspondence from IWD. On that date, Ms. Christner had Ms. Starr open and read to Ms. Christner the correspondence, a notice of claim concerning claimant Taylor Dowd. Ms. Christner had Ms. Starr scan and email the notice of claim, front and back, to her. Ms. Christner received the copy of the notice of claim into her possession on February 22, 2024.

On February 26, 2024, Ms. Christner added protest information to the notice of claim form and signed to certify the accuracy of the information she had provided. Ms. Christner asked hotel staff to assist her with faxing the protest to Iowa Workforce Development. For some unknown reason, the fax did not transmit. The hotel staff immediately notified Ms. Christner that the document did not transmit. Ms. Christner then set the matter aside and did make further effort to submit a protest by the February 26, 2024 protest deadline.

After Ms. Christner returned to the Iowa City/Coralville area late on February 29, 2024, she returned to work on March 1, 2024 and continued thereafter to operate her business.

On March 14, 2024, Ms. Christner used her phone to take a photo of the front and back of the completed notice of claim/protest and emailed the protest to lowa Workforce Development at the email address on the back of the notice of claim form. IWD received the protest on March 14, 2024 and marked it late.

REASONING AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW:

Iowa Code section 96.6(2) provides, in pertinent part:

2. Initial determination. A representative designated by the director shall promptly notify all interested parties to the claim of its filing, and the parties have ten days from the date of mailing the notice of the filing of the claim by ordinary mail to the last known address to protest payment of benefits to the claimant.

Another portion of this same Code section dealing with timeliness of an appeal from a representative's decision states that such an appeal must be filed within ten days after notification of that decision was mailed. In addressing an issue of timeliness of an appeal under that portion of this Code section, the lowa Supreme Court held that this statute prescribing the time for notice of appeal clearly limits the time to do so, and that compliance with the appeal notice provision is mandatory and jurisdictional. *Beardslee v. IDJS*, 276 N.W.2d 373 (lowa 1979). The administrative law judge considers the reasoning and holding of the court to be controlling on this portion of that same lowa Code section which deals with a time limit in which to file a protest after notification of the filing of the claim has been mailed.

Iowa Administrative Code Rule 87124.8(2)(a) and (b) provide as follows:

(2) Responding by employing units to a notice of the filing of an initial claim or a request for wage and separation information and protesting the payment of benefits.

- a. The employing unit which receives a Form 65-5317, Notice of Claim, or a Form 68-0221, Request for Wage and Separation Information, must, within ten days of the date of the notice or request, submit to the department wage or separation information that affects the individual's rights to benefits, including any facts which disclose that the individual separated from employment voluntarily and without good cause attributable to the employer or was discharged for misconduct in connection with employment.
- b. The employing unit may protest the payment of benefits if the protest is postmarked within ten days of the date of the notice of the filing of an initial claim. In the event that the tenth day falls on a Saturday, Sunday or holiday, the protest period is extended to the next working day of the department. If the employing unit has filed a timely report of facts that might adversely affect the individual's benefit rights, the report shall be considered as a protest to the payment of benefits.

Iowa Administrative Code Rule 871-24.35(1) provides:

Date of submission and extension of time for payments and notices.

- (1) Except as otherwise provided by statute or by division rule, any payment, appeal, application, request, notice, objection, petition, report or other information or document submitted to the division shall be considered received by and filed with the division:
- a. If transmitted via the United States Postal Service on the date it is mailed as shown by the postmark, or in the absence of a postmark the postage meter mark of the envelope in which it is received; or if not postmarked or postage meter marked or if the mark is illegible, on the date entered on the document as the date of completion.
- b. If transmitted via the State Identification Data Exchange System (SIDES), maintained by the United States Department of Labor, on the date it was submitted to SIDES.
- c. If transmitted by any means other than those outlined in paragraphs 24.35(1)"a" and "b", on the date it is received by the division.

Iowa Administrative Code Rule 871-24.35(2) provides:

Date of submission and extension of time for payments and notices.

- (2) The submission of any payment, appeal, application, request, notice, objection, petition, report or other information or document not within the specified statutory or regulatory period shall be considered timely if it is established to the satisfaction of the division that the delay in submission was due to division error or misinformation or to delay or other action of the United States postal service.
- a. For submission that is not within the statutory or regulatory period to be considered timely, the interested party must submit a written explanation setting forth the circumstances of the delay.
- b. The division shall designate personnel who are to decide whether an extension of time shall be granted.

- c. No submission shall be considered timely if the delay in filing was unreasonable, as determined by the department after considering the circumstances in the case.
- d. If submission is not considered timely, although the interested party contends that the delay was due to division error or misinformation or delay or other action of the United States postal service, the division shall issue an appealable decision to the interested party.

The evidence in the record establishes an untimely employer protest. The notice of claim was delivered to the employer's address of record in a timely manner. Despite Ms. Christner's need to remain available to assist her father as needed during his hospitalization at Mayo Clinic, the employer received a copy of the notice of claim form into her personal possession on February 22, 2022 and had a reasonable opportunity to file a protest by February 26, 2024 protest. Though the employer knew on February 26, 2024 that the attempt to fax the protest on that day was unsuccessful, and though there was still time to transmit a protest by email or by alternative fax means, the employer did not take additional reasonable steps to transmit a timely protest on February 26, 2024. The employer thereafter tabled the matter for more than two weeks. Indeed the employer had been back at work for two weeks when the employer finally transmitted a protest on March 14, 2024 by email, something the employer could have done on or before February 26, 2024. The weight of the evidence establishes unreasonable delay attributable to the employer and not attributable to IWD or the USPS. There is not good cause to treat the March 14, 2024 late protest as a timely protest. Accordingly, the administrative law judge lacks jurisdiction to disturb IWD's initial determination regarding the nature of the claimant's separation from the employment, the claimant's eligibility for benefits, and the employer's liability for benefits. The initial determination of the claimant's eligibility for benefits and the employer's liability for benefits shall remain in effect.

DECISION:

The March 18, 2024 (reference 02) decision is AFFIRMED. The employer's protest was untimely. The claimant is eligible for benefits, provided she is otherwise eligible. The employer's account may be charged for benefits.

James E. Timberland Administrative Law Judge

James & Timberland

April 18, 2024

Decision Dated and Mailed

scn

APPEAL RIGHTS. If you disagree with the decision, you or any interested party may:

1. Appeal to the Employment Appeal Board within fifteen (15) days of the date under the judge's signature by submitting a written appeal via mail, fax, or online to:

Employment Appeal Board 6200 Park Ave Suite 100 Des Moines, Iowa 50321 Fax: (515)281-7191 Online: eab.iowa.gov

The appeal period will be extended to the next business day if the last day to appeal falls on a weekend or a legal holiday.

AN APPEAL TO THE BOARD SHALL STATE CLEARLY:

- 1) The name, address, and social security number of the claimant.
- 2) A reference to the decision from which the appeal is taken.
- 3) That an appeal from such decision is being made and such appeal is signed.
- 4) The grounds upon which such appeal is based.

An Employment Appeal Board decision is final agency action. If a party disagrees with the Employment Appeal Board decision, they may then file a petition for judicial review in district court.

2. If no one files an appeal of the judge's decision with the Employment Appeal Board within fifteen (15) days, the decision becomes final agency action, and you have the option to file a petition for judicial review in District Court within thirty (30) days after the decision becomes final. Additional information on how to file a petition can be found at lowa Code §17A.19, which is online at https://www.legis.iowa.gov/docs/code/17A.19.pdf.

Note to Parties: YOU MAY REPRESENT yourself in the appeal or obtain a lawyer or other interested party to do so provided there is no expense to Workforce Development. If you wish to be represented by a lawyer, you may obtain the services of either a private attorney or one whose services are paid for with public funds.

Note to Claimant: It is important that you file your weekly claim as directed, while this appeal is pending, to protect your continuing right to benefits.

SERVICE INFORMATION:

A true and correct copy of this decision was mailed to each of the parties listed.

DERECHOS DE APELACIÓN. Si no está de acuerdo con la decisión, usted o cualquier parte interesada puede:

1. Apelar a la Junta de Apelaciones de Empleo dentro de los quince (15) días de la fecha bajo la firma del juez presentando una apelación por escrito por correo, fax o en línea a:

Employment Appeal Board 6200 Park Ave Suite 100 Des Moines, Iowa 50321 Fax: (515)281-7191 Online: eab.iowa.gov

El período de apelación se extenderá hasta el siguiente día hábil si el último día para apelar cae en fin de semana o día feriado legal.

UNA APELACIÓN A LA JUNTA DEBE ESTABLECER CLARAMENTE:

- 1) El nombre, dirección y número de seguro social del reclamante.
- 2) Una referencia a la decisión de la que se toma la apelación.
- 3) Que se interponga recurso de apelación contra tal decisión y se firme dicho recurso.
- 4) Los fundamentos en que se funda dicho recurso.

Una decisión de la Junta de Apelaciones de Empleo es una acción final de la agencia. Si una de las partes no está de acuerdo con la decisión de la Junta de Apelación de Empleo, puede presentar una petición de revisión judicial en el tribunal de distrito.

2. Si nadie presenta una apelación de la decisión del juez ante la Junta de Apelaciones Laborales dentro de los quince (15) días, la decisión se convierte en acción final de la agencia y usted tiene la opción de presentar una petición de revisión judicial en el Tribunal de Distrito dentro de los treinta (30) días después de que la decisión adquiera firmeza. Puede encontrar información adicional sobre cómo presentar una petición en el Código de Iowa §17A.19, que está en línea en https://www.legis.iowa.gov/docs/code/17A.19.pdf.

Nota para las partes: USTED PUEDE REPRESENTARSE en la apelación u obtener un abogado u otra parte interesada para que lo haga, siempre que no haya gastos para Workforce Development. Si desea ser representado por un abogado, puede obtener los servicios de un abogado privado o uno cuyos servicios se paguen con fondos públicos.

Nota para el reclamante: es importante que presente su reclamo semanal según las instrucciones, mientras esta apelación está pendiente, para proteger su derecho continuo a los beneficios.

SERVICIO DE INFORMACIÓN:

Se envió por correo una copia fiel y correcta de esta decisión a cada una de las partes enumeradas.