## IOWA DEPARTMENT OF INSPECTIONS AND APPEALS ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS DIVISION, UI APPEALS BUREAU

SHEILA R LINGE Claimant

# APPEAL 23A-UI-00513-SC-T

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE DECISION

MAIN STREET PUB LLC Employer

> OC: 12/18/22 Claimant: Respondent (2)

Iowa Code § 96.5(1) – Voluntary Quitting Iowa Code § 96.3(7) – Recovery of Benefit Overpayment Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.10 – Employer/Representative Participation Fact-finding Interview

## STATEMENT OF THE CASE:

On January 17, 2023, Main Street Pub, LLC (employer) filed an appeal from the January 12, 2023, reference 01, unemployment insurance decision that allowed benefits based upon the determination Sheila R. Linge (claimant) voluntarily quit employment due to detrimental working conditions. The parties were properly notified about the hearing held by telephone on February 9, 2023. The claimant did not respond to the hearing notice and did not participate. The employer participated through Bryce Anderson, Kitchen Manager. No exhibits were offered into the record. The administrative law judge took official notice of the fact-finding documents.

## **ISSUES:**

Did the claimant voluntarily quit employment with good cause attributable to the employer? Has the claimant been overpaid unemployment insurance benefits and, if so, can the repayment of those benefits to the agency be waived and charged to the employer's account?

#### FINDINGS OF FACT:

Having reviewed all the evidence in the record, the administrative law judge finds: The claimant was employed part-time as a Line Worker/Waitress/Bartender beginning on August 25, 2022, and her last day worked was November 22, 2022. On that evening, the claimant had a disagreement with Bryce Anderson (Anderson), Kitchen Manager, when he told her that she needed to include all food on a ticket. Two to three hours later, the number of customers increased, and the claimant became flustered. The claimant clapped her hands, gave the

peace sign, and said, "I am out, I am done with this.<sup>1</sup>" The claimant had a subsequent meeting with Kelly Anderson (K. Anderson), Owner; however, it is unknown what was discussed.

The administrative record reflects that claimant has received \$2,904.00 in regular unemployment benefits, since filing a claim with an effective date of December 18, 2022, for the eight weeks between December 18 and February 11, 2023. The employer did not participate in the fact-finding interview. K. Anderson is the person who handles unemployment insurance claims, but she was out of the country. She did not request to postpone the hearing and was unable to call in for the hearing. Therefore, Anderson, her husband, participated in her place, and he did not have any information about the fact-finding notice.

## REASONING AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW:

*I.* Did the claimant voluntarily quit employment with good cause attributable to the employer?

For the following reasons, the administrative law judge concludes claimant's separation from the employment was without good cause attributable to the employer. Benefits are denied.

Iowa Code section 96.5(1) provides:

An individual shall be disqualified for benefits, regardless of the source of the individual's wage credits:

1. Voluntary quitting. If the individual has left work voluntarily without good cause attributable to the individual's employer, if so found by the department.

Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.25 provides, in relevant part:

Voluntary quit without good cause. In general, a voluntary quit means discontinuing the employment because the employee no longer desires to remain in the relationship of an employee with the employer from whom the employee has separated. The employer has the burden of proving that the claimant is disqualified for benefits pursuant to Iowa Code section 96.5. However, the claimant has the initial burden to produce evidence that the claimant is not disqualified for benefits in cases involving Iowa Code section 96.5, subsection (1), paragraphs "a" through "i," and subsection 10. The following reasons for a voluntary quit shall be presumed to be without good cause attributable to the employer:

...

- (21) The claimant left because of dissatisfaction with the work environment.
- (22) The claimant left because of a personality conflict with the supervisor.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Anderson's Testimony.

The claimant has the burden of proving that the voluntary leaving was for good cause attributable to the employer.<sup>2</sup> "Good cause" for leaving employment must be that which is reasonable to the average person, not the overly sensitive individual or the claimant in particular.<sup>3</sup> A voluntary leaving of employment requires an intention to terminate the employment relationship accompanied by an overt act of carrying out that intention.<sup>4</sup>

The unrefuted testimony is that the claimant left due to a dislike of the work environment and disagreements with Anderson. The claimant has not met the burden of proof to establish that she left with good cause attributable to the employer. Accordingly, benefits are denied.

*II.* Has the claimant been overpaid unemployment insurance benefits and, if so, can the repayment of those benefits to the agency be waived and charged to the employer's account?

The administrative law judge further concludes the claimant has been overpaid unemployment insurance benefits but is not required to repay those benefits. The employer did not participate in the fact-finding interview and has not established that the lack of participation was due to insufficient notice from Iowa Workforce Development (IWD).

Iowa Code section 96.3(7)a-b, as amended in 2008, provides:

7. Recovery of overpayment of benefits.

a. If an individual receives benefits for which the individual is subsequently determined to be ineligible, even though the individual acts in good faith and is not otherwise at fault, the benefits shall be recovered. The department in its discretion may recover the overpayment of benefits either by having a sum equal to the overpayment deducted from any future benefits payable to the individual or by having the individual pay to the department a sum equal to the overpayment.

b. (1) (a) If the department determines that an overpayment has been made, the charge for the overpayment against the employer's account shall be removed and the account shall be credited with an amount equal to the overpayment from the unemployment compensation trust fund and this credit shall include both contributory and reimbursable employers, notwithstanding section 96.8, subsection 5. The employer shall not be relieved of charges if benefits are paid because the employer or an agent of the employer failed to respond timely or adequately to the department's request for information relating to the payment of benefits. This prohibition against relief of charges shall apply to both contributory and reimbursable employers. If the department determines that an employer's failure to respond timely or adequately was due to insufficient notification from the department, the employer's account shall not be charged for the overpayment.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Iowa Code § 96.6(2).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Uniweld Products v. Indus. Relations Comm'n, 277 So.2d 827 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. 1973).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Local Lodge #1426 v. Wilson Trailer, 289 N.W.2d 608, 612 (Iowa 1980).

(b) However, provided the benefits were not received as the result of fraud or willful misrepresentation by the individual, benefits shall not be recovered from an individual if the employer did not participate in the initial determination to award benefits pursuant to section 96.6, subsection 2, and an overpayment occurred because of a subsequent reversal on appeal regarding the issue of the individual's separation from employment.

(2) An accounting firm, agent, unemployment insurance accounting firm, or other entity that represents an employer in unemployment claim matters and demonstrates a continuous pattern of failing to participate in the initial determinations to award benefits, as determined and defined by rule by the department, shall be denied permission by the department to represent any employers in unemployment insurance matters. This subparagraph does not apply to attorneys or counselors admitted to practice in the courts of this state pursuant to section 602.10101.

Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.10(1) provides:

Employer and employer representative participation in fact-finding interviews.

(1) "Participate," as the term is used for employers in the context of the initial determination to award benefits pursuant to lowa Code section 96.6. subsection 2, means submitting detailed factual information of the quantity and quality that if unrebutted would be sufficient to result in a decision favorable to the employer. The most effective means to participate is to provide live testimony at the interview from a witness with firsthand knowledge of the events leading to the separation. If no live testimony is provided, the employer must provide the name and telephone number of an employee with firsthand information who may be contacted, if necessary, for rebuttal. A party may also participate by providing detailed written statements or documents that provide detailed factual information of the events leading to separation. At a minimum, the information provided by the employer or the employer's representative must identify the dates and particular circumstances of the incident or incidents, including, in the case of discharge, the act or omissions of the claimant or, in the event of a voluntary separation, the stated reason for the quit. The specific rule or policy must be submitted if the claimant was discharged for violating such rule or policy. In the case of discharge for attendance violations, the information must include the circumstances of all incidents the employer or the employer's representative contends meet the definition of unexcused absences as set forth in 871-subrule 24.32(7). On the other hand, written or oral statements or general conclusions without supporting detailed factual information and information submitted after the fact-finding decision has been issued are not considered participation within the meaning of the statute.

Because the claimant's separation was disqualifying, benefits were paid to which she was not entitled. The unemployment insurance law provides that benefits must be recovered from a claimant who receives benefits and is later determined to be ineligible for benefits, even though the claimant acted in good faith and was not otherwise at fault.<sup>5</sup> However, an overpayment, which results from a reversal of an initial allowance of benefits based on a separation, will not

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Iowa Code § 96.3(7).

be recovered if: (1) the benefits were not received due to any fraud or willful misrepresentation by the claimant and (2) the employer did not participate in the initial proceeding to award benefits.<sup>6</sup> The employer will not be charged for benefits if it is determined that they did participate in the fact-finding interview.<sup>7</sup>

In this case, the claimant has received benefits, but they were not eligible for those benefits. The employer did not participate in the fact-finding interview. The employer has not met the burden to establish that the lack of participation was due to insufficient notice from IWD. Since the employer did not participate in the fact-finding interview, the claimant is not obligated to repay to the agency the benefits they received. As the employer has not establish that the failure to participate was due to IWD, the employer's account shall be charged.

## DECISION:

The January 12, 2023, reference 01, unemployment insurance decision is REVERSED. The claimant voluntarily left the employment without good cause attributable to the employer. Benefits are withheld until such time as she has worked in and been paid wages for insured work equal to ten times her weekly benefit amount, provided she is otherwise eligible.

The claimant has been overpaid unemployment insurance benefits in the amount of \$2,904.00 but is not obligated to repay the agency those benefits. The employer did not participate in the fact-finding interview and has not established that failure was due to insufficient notice from IWD; therefore, its account shall be charged.

Supranie & Can

Stephanie R. Callahan Administrative Law Judge

<u>February 23, 2023</u> Decision Dated and Mailed

src/mh

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.10(1).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Iowa Code § 96.3(7), Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.10.

APPEAL RIGHTS. If you disagree with the decision, you or any interested party may:

1. Appeal to the Employment Appeal Board within fifteen (15) days of the date under the judge's signature by submitting a written appeal via mail, fax, or online to:

#### Employment Appeal Board 4<sup>th</sup> Floor – Lucas Building Des Moines, Iowa 50319 Fax: (515)281-7191 Online: eab.iowa.gov

The appeal period will be extended to the next business day if the last day to appeal falls on a weekend or a legal holiday.

AN APPEAL TO THE BOARD SHALL STATE CLEARLY:

1) The name, address, and social security number of the claimant.

2) A reference to the decision from which the appeal is taken.

3) That an appeal from such decision is being made and such appeal is signed.

4) The grounds upon which such appeal is based.

An Employment Appeal Board decision is final agency action. If a party disagrees with the Employment Appeal Board decision, they may then file a petition for judicial review in district court.

2. If no one files an appeal of the judge's decision with the Employment Appeal Board within fifteen (15) days, the decision becomes final agency action, and you have the option to file a petition for judicial review in District Court within thirty (30) days after the decision becomes final. Additional information on how to file a petition can be found at lowa Code §17A.19, which is online at <a href="https://www.legis.iowa.gov/docs/code/17A.19.pdf">https://www.legis.iowa.gov/docs/code/17A.19.pdf</a> or by contacting the District Court Clerk of Court <a href="https://www.iowacourts.gov/iowa-courts/court-directory/">https://www.iowacourts.gov/iowa-courts/court-directory/</a>.

**Note to Parties:** YOU MAY REPRESENT yourself in the appeal or obtain a lawyer or other interested party to do so provided there is no expense to Workforce Development. If you wish to be represented by a lawyer, you may obtain the services of either a private attorney or one whose services are paid for with public funds.

**Note to Claimant:** It is important that you file your weekly claim as directed, while this appeal is pending, to protect your continuing right to benefits.

#### SERVICE INFORMATION:

A true and correct copy of this decision was mailed to each of the parties listed.

DERECHOS DE APELACIÓN. Si no está de acuerdo con la decisión, usted o cualquier parte interesada puede:

1. Apelar a la Junta de Apelaciones de Empleo dentro de los quince (15) días de la fecha bajo la firma del juez presentando una apelación por escrito por correo, fax o en línea a:

#### Employment Appeal Board 4th Floor – Lucas Building Des Moines, Iowa 50319 Fax: (515)281-7191 En línea: eab.iowa.gov

El período de apelación se extenderá hasta el siguiente día hábil si el último día para apelar cae en fin de semana o día feriado legal.

UNA APELACIÓN A LA JUNTA DEBE ESTABLECER CLARAMENTE:

- 1) El nombre, dirección y número de seguro social del reclamante.
- 2) Una referencia a la decisión de la que se toma la apelación.
- 3) Que se interponga recurso de apelación contra tal decisión y se firme dicho recurso.

4) Los fundamentos en que se funda dicho recurso.

Una decisión de la Junta de Apelaciones de Empleo es una acción final de la agencia. Si una de las partes no está de acuerdo con la decisión de la Junta de Apelación de Empleo, puede presentar una petición de revisión judicial en el tribunal de distrito.

2. Si nadie presenta una apelación de la decisión del juez ante la Junta de Apelaciones Laborales dentro de los quince (15) días, la decisión se convierte en acción final de la agencia y usted tiene la opción de presentar una petición de revisión judicial en el Tribunal de Distrito dentro de los treinta (30) días después de que la decisión adquiera firmeza. Puede encontrar información adicional sobre cómo presentar una petición en el Código de Iowa §17A.19, que se encuentra en línea en https://www.legis.iowa.gov/docs/code/17A.19.pdf o comunicándose con el Tribunal de Distrito Secretario del tribunal https:///www.iowacourts.gov/iowa-courts/court-directory/.

**Nota para las partes:** USTED PUEDE REPRESENTARSE en la apelación u obtener un abogado u otra parte interesada para que lo haga, siempre que no haya gastos para Workforce Development. Si desea ser representado por un abogado, puede obtener los servicios de un abogado privado o uno cuyos servicios se paguen con fondos públicos.

**Nota para el reclamante:** es importante que presente su reclamo semanal según las instrucciones, mientras esta apelación está pendiente, para proteger su derecho continuo a los beneficios.

#### SERVICIO DE INFORMACIÓN:

Se envió por correo una copia fiel y correcta de esta decisión a cada una de las partes enumeradas.