# IN THE IOWA ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS DIVISION UNEMPLOYMENT INSURANCE APPEALS BUREAU

**JULIE L FERBER** 

Claimant

**APPEAL 25A-UI-02745-DS-T** 

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE DECISION

**CASEYS MARKETING COMPANY** 

**Employer** 

OC: 03/09/25

Claimant: Respondent (2)

Iowa Code § 96.6(2) – Timely Appeal

Iowa Code § 96.5(1) – Voluntary Quitting

Iowa Code Section 96.3(7) - Overpayment of Benefits

Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.10 – Employer/Representative Participation Fact-finding Interview

#### STATEMENT OF THE CASE:

On April 7, 2025, the employer filed a timely appeal from the unemployment insurance decision dated March 25, 2025, (Reference 01), that allowed benefits. Notice of hearing was mailed to the parties' last known addresses of record for a telephone hearing to be held at 1:00 p.m. on April 28, 2025. The claimant participated personally. The employer participated through Megan Milligan, Hearing Representative, and Erica Soto, District Manager. Employer Exhibit A (Pages 5-8) was admitted to the record. The administrative law judge took official notice of the administrative record.

#### ISSUES:

Is the appeal timely?

Did the claimant voluntarily quit the employment without good cause attributable to the employer?

Was the claimant overpaid benefits?

Should the claimant repay benefits or should the employer be charged based upon participation in the fact-finding interview?

#### FINDINGS OF FACT:

Having reviewed all of the evidence in the record, the administrative law judge finds:

The claimant worked as a Team Member for this employer from January 2, 2024, until February 17, 2025, when she voluntarily quit the employment. The claimant last worked on February 13, 2025. The claimant sent a text message to Erica Soto advising her that she needed to quit due to stress and anxiety. The claimant testified that she is very sensitive and did not like being corrected by her supervisor while in the workplace, but instead felt that she should be corrected privately. The claimant also felt that she was not receiving enough hours, although the claimant was a part-time employee and had never received any guarantee of a certain number of hours.

The claimant's benefit records indicate that the claimant has received \$1,020.00 in unemployment insurance benefits for three weeks since this separation. The employer did participate in the fact-finding interview by submitting sufficient written information.

### **REASONING AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW:**

For the reasons that follow, this Administrative Law Judge finds that the employer's appeal should be deemed timely.

Iowa Code § 96.6(2) provides:

2. Initial determination. A representative designated by the director shall promptly notify all interested parties to the claim of its filing, and the parties have ten days from the date of mailing the notice of the filing of the claim by ordinary mail to the last known address to protest payment of benefits to the claimant. The representative shall promptly examine the claim and any protest, take the initiative to ascertain relevant information concerning the claim, and, on the basis of the facts found by the representative, shall determine whether or not the claim is valid, the week with respect to which benefits shall commence, the weekly benefit amount payable and its maximum duration, and whether any disqualification shall be imposed. The claimant has the burden of proving that the claimant meets the basic eligibility conditions of § 96.4. The employer has the burden of proving that the claimant is disqualified for benefits pursuant to § 96.5, except as provided by this subsection. The claimant has the initial burden to produce evidence showing that the claimant is not disqualified for benefits in cases involving § 96.5, subsection 10, and has the burden of proving that a voluntary guit pursuant to § 96.5, subsection 1, was for good cause attributable to the employer and that the claimant is not disqualified for benefits in cases involving § 96.5, subsection 1, paragraphs "a" through "h". Unless the claimant or other interested party, after notification or within ten calendar days after notification was mailed to the claimant's last known address, files an appeal from the decision, the decision is final and benefits shall be paid or denied in accordance with the decision. If an administrative law judge affirms a decision of the representative, or the appeal board affirms a decision of the administrative law judge allowing benefits, the benefits shall be paid regardless of any appeal which is thereafter taken, but if the decision is finally reversed, no employer's account shall be charged with benefits so paid and this relief from charges shall apply to both contributory and reimbursable employers, notwithstanding § 96.8, subsection 5.

The portion of this Code section dealing with timeliness of an appeal from a representative's decision states that such an appeal must be filed within ten days after notification of that decision was mailed. In addressing an issue of timeliness of an appeal under that portion of this Code section, the lowa Supreme Court held that this statute prescribing the time for notice of appeal clearly limits the time to do so, and that compliance with the appeal notice provision is mandatory and jurisdictional. *Beardslee v. Iowa Dep't of Job Serv.*, 276 N.W.2d 373 (Iowa 1979).

Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-26.3 provides, in relevant part:

1. An unemployment benefits contested case must be filed by a party within ten calendar days of mailing the initial determination of benefits as determined by the postmark or date stamp to the party's last-known address. The appeal must be in

writing and delivered by mail, facsimile, email, online, or in person to the department of inspections, appeals, and licensing's unemployment insurance appeals bureau at UIAB Administrative Hearings Division, 502 East 9th Street, Des Moines, Iowa 50319. An online appeal is filed by completing and submitting an online appeal form available on the workforce development website.

- 2. The appeal should state the following:
  - a. The name, address and social security number of the claimant;
  - b. A reference to the decision from which appeal is taken; and,
  - c. The grounds upon which the appeal is based.

The employer did not file an appeal until April 7, 2025. However, the employer credibly testified that April 7, 2025, was also the day the employer received the decision in the mail. The employer appealed as soon as they were aware of the decision. Therefore, the employer's appeal in this matter shall be considered timely.

For the reasons that follow, the Administrative Law Judge concludes that the claimant's separation from the employment was without good cause attributable to the employer. Benefits are denied.

Iowa Code section 96.5(1) provides:

An individual shall be disqualified for benefits, regardless of the source of the individual's wage credits:

1. Voluntary quitting. If the individual has left work voluntarily without good cause attributable to the individual's employer, if so found by the department.

Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.18 provides, in relevant parts:

Voluntary quit without good cause. In general, a voluntary quit means discontinuing the employment because the employee no longer desires to remain in the relationship with the employer from whom the employee has separated. The employer has the burden of proving that the claimant is disqualified for benefits, but the claimant has the initial burden to produce evidence that the claimant is not disqualified for benefits in cases involving lowa Code sections 96.5(1)"a" through "i" and 96.5(10). The following reasons for a voluntary quit are be presumed to be without good cause attributable to the employer:

- (18) Claimant left because of a personality conflict with the supervisor.
- (24) Claimant left after being reprimanded.

The claimant has the burden of proving that the voluntary leaving was for good cause attributable to the employer. Iowa Code § 96.6(2). "Good cause" for leaving employment must be that which is reasonable to the average person, not the overly sensitive individual or the claimant in particular. *Uniweld Products v. Indus. Relations Comm'n*, 277 So.2d 827 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. 1973). A voluntary leaving of employment requires an intention to terminate the

employment relationship accompanied by an overt act of carrying out that intention. *Local Lodge* #1426 v. Wilson Trailer, 289 N.W.2d 608, 612 (Iowa 1980).

The employer credibly testified that the claimant quit the job by text message. The claimant admits that she is overly sensitive to criticism and correction and did not like being reprimanded or corrected in the presence of others. The claimant felt that she had ongoing conflicts with her supervisor, and left the employment due to these reprimands. Further, the claimant left because she did not feel she was receiving adequate hours. However, this Administrative Law Judge does not find credible the claimant's testimony that she was guaranteed fifteen hours per week at hire. The claimant has demonstrated no good cause reason for quitting the employment attributable to the employer. Benefits are denied.

Iowa Code section 96.3(7)a, b, as amended in 2008, provides:

Payment – determination – duration – child support intercept.

- 7. Recovery of overpayment of benefits.
- a. If an individual receives benefits for which the individual is subsequently determined to be ineligible, even though the individual acts in good faith and is not otherwise at fault, the benefits shall be recovered. The department in its discretion may recover the overpayment of benefits either by having a sum equal to the overpayment deducted from any future benefits payable to the individual or by having the individual pay to the department a sum equal to the overpayment.
- b. (1) (a) If the department determines that an overpayment has been made, the charge for the overpayment against the employer's account shall be removed and the account shall be credited with an amount equal to the overpayment from the unemployment compensation trust fund and this credit shall include both contributory and reimbursable employers, notwithstanding section 96.8, subsection 5. The employer shall not be relieved of charges if benefits are paid because the employer or an agent of the employer failed to respond timely or adequately to the department's request for information relating to the payment of benefits. This prohibition against relief of charges shall apply to both contributory and reimbursable employers.
- (b) However, provided the benefits were not received as the result of fraud or willful misrepresentation by the individual, benefits shall not be recovered from an individual if the employer did not participate in the initial determination to award benefits pursuant to section 96.6, subsection 2, and an overpayment occurred because of a subsequent reversal on appeal regarding the issue of the individual's separation from employment.
- (2) An accounting firm, agent, unemployment insurance accounting firm, or other entity that represents an employer in unemployment claim matters and demonstrates a continuous pattern of failing to participate in the initial determinations to award benefits, as determined and defined by rule by the department, shall be denied permission by the department to represent any employers in unemployment insurance matters. This subparagraph does not apply to attorneys or counselors admitted to practice in the courts of this state pursuant to section 602.10101.

Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.10 provides:

Employer and employer representative participation in fact-finding interviews.

- (1)"Participate," as the term is used for employers in the context of the initial determination to award benefits pursuant to Iowa Code section 96.6(2), means submitting detailed factual information of the quantity and quality that if unrebutted would be sufficient to result in a decision favorable to the employer. The most effective means to participate is to provide live testimony at the interview from a witness with firsthand knowledge of the events leading to the separation. If no live testimony is provided, the employer must provide the name and telephone number of an employee with firsthand information who may be contacted, if necessary, for rebuttal. A party may also participate by providing written statements or documents that provide detailed factual information of the events leading to separation. At a minimum, the information provided by the employer or the employer's representative must identify the dates and particular circumstances of the incident or incidents, including, in the case of discharge, the act or omissions of the claimant or, in the event of a voluntary separation, the stated reason for the guit. The specific rule or policy must be submitted if the claimant was discharged for violating such rule or policy. In the case of discharge for attendance violations, the information must include the circumstances of all incidents the employer or the employer's representative contends meet the definition of unexcused absences as set forth in 871—subrule 24.24(7). Written or oral statements or general conclusions without supporting detailed factual information and information submitted after the fact-finding decision has been issued are not considered participation within the meaning of the statute.
- (2) "A continuous pattern of nonparticipation in the initial determination to award benefits," pursuant to lowa Code section 96.6(2), as the term is used for an entity representing employers, means on 25 or more occasions in a calendar quarter the entity files appeals after failing to participate. Appeals filed but withdrawn before the day of the contested case hearing will not be considered in determining if a continuous pattern of nonparticipation exists. The division administrator will notify the employer's representative in writing after each such appeal.
- (3) If the division administrator finds that an entity representing employers as defined in Iowa Code section 96.6(2) has engaged in a continuous pattern of nonparticipation, the division administrator will suspend the representative for a period of up to six months on the first occasion, up to one year on the second occasion and up to ten years on any subsequent occasion. Suspension by the division administrator constitutes final agency action and may be appealed pursuant to Iowa Code section 17A.19.
- (4) "Fraud or willful misrepresentation by the individual," as the term is used for claimants in the context of the initial determination to award benefits pursuant to lowa Code section 96.6(2), means providing knowingly false statements or knowingly false denials of material facts for the purpose of obtaining unemployment insurance benefits. Statements or denials may be either oral or written by the claimant. Inadvertent misstatements or mistakes made in good faith are not considered fraud or willful misrepresentation.

This rule is intended to implement Iowa Code section 96.3(7)"b."

Because the claimant's separation was disqualifying, benefits were paid to which the claimant was not entitled. The unemployment insurance law provides that benefits must be recovered from a claimant who receives benefits and is later determined to be ineligible for benefits, even though the claimant acted in good faith and was not otherwise at fault. However, the overpayment will not be recovered when it is based on a reversal on appeal of an initial determination to award benefits on an issue regarding the claimant's employment separation if: (1) the benefits were not received due to any fraud or willful misrepresentation by the claimant and (2) the employer did not participate in the initial proceeding to award benefits. The employer will not be charged for benefits if it is determined that they did participate in the fact-finding interview. lowa Code § 96.3(7), lowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.10. In this case, the claimant has received benefits but was not eligible for those benefits. The administrative record reflects that claimant has received \$1,020.00 in regular unemployment benefits since filling this claim. The claimant is overpaid benefits and must repay those benefits. The employer participated in the fact-finding interview by submitting sufficient written information. Its account shall not be charged.

## **DECISION:**

The March 25, 2025, (Reference 01) unemployment insurance decision allowing benefits is REVERSED. The claimant voluntarily left the employment without good cause attributable to the employer. Benefits are withheld until such time as the claimant has worked in and been paid wages for insured work equal to ten times the claimant's weekly benefit amount, provided the claimant is otherwise eligible. The claimant is overpaid \$1,020.00 in unemployment insurance benefits and must repay those benefits. The employer's account shall not be charged.

David J. Steen

Administrative Law Judge

May 1, 2025

**Decision Dated and Mailed** 

scn

**APPEAL RIGHTS.** If you disagree with the decision, you or any interested party may:

1. Appeal to the Employment Appeal Board within fifteen (15) days of the date under the judge's signature by submitting a written appeal via mail, fax, or online to:

Iowa Employment Appeal Board 6200 Park Avenue Suite 100 Des Moines, Iowa 50321 Fax: (515)281-7191 Online: eab.iowa.gov

The appeal period will be extended to the next business day if the last day to appeal falls on a weekend or a legal holiday. There is no filing fee to file an appeal with the Employment Appeal Board.

# AN APPEAL TO THE BOARD SHALL STATE CLEARLY:

- 1) The name, address, and social security number of the claimant.
- 2) A reference to the decision from which the appeal is taken.
- 3) That an appeal from such decision is being made and such appeal is signed.
- 4) The grounds upon which such appeal is based.

An Employment Appeal Board decision is final agency action. If a party disagrees with the Employment Appeal Board decision, they may file a petition for judicial review in district court.

2. If you do not file an appeal of the judge's decision with the Employment Appeal Board within fifteen (15) days, the decision becomes final agency action, and you have the option to file a petition for judicial review in District Court within thirty (30) days after the decision becomes final. Additional information on how to file a petition can be found at <a href="https://www.iowacourts.gov/efile">www.iowacourts.gov/efile</a>. There may be a filing fee to file the petition in District Court.

**Note to Parties:** YOU MAY REPRESENT yourself in the appeal or obtain a lawyer or other interested party to do so provided there is no expense to Workforce Development. If you wish to be represented by a lawyer, you may obtain the services of either a private attorney or one whose services are paid for with public funds.

**Note to Claimant:** It is important that you file your weekly claim as directed, while this appeal is pending, to protect your continuing right to benefits.

# **SERVICE INFORMATION:**

A true and correct copy of this decision was mailed to each of the parties listed.

**DERECHOS DE APELACIÓN.** Si no está de acuerdo con la decisión, usted o cualquier parte interesada puede:

1. Apelar a la Junta de Apelaciones de Empleo dentro de los quince (15) días de la fecha bajo la firma del juez presentando una apelación por escrito por correo, fax o en línea a:

Iowa Employment Appeal Board 6200 Park Avenue Suite 100 Des Moines, Iowa 50321 Fax: (515)281-7191

En línea: eab.iowa.gov

El período de apelación se extenderá hasta el siguiente día hábil si el último día para apelar cae en fin de semana o día feriado legal. No hay tarifa de presentación para presentar una apelación ante la Junta de Apelación de Empleo.

## UNA APELACIÓN A LA JUNTA DEBE ESTABLECER CLARAMENTE:

- 1) El nombre, dirección y número de seguro social del reclamante.
- 2) Una referencia a la decisión de la que se toma la apelación.
- 3) Que se interponga recurso de apelación contra tal decisión y se firme dicho recurso.
- 4) Los fundamentos en que se funda dicho recurso.

Una decisión de la Junta de Apelaciones de Empleo es una acción final de la agencia. Si una de las partes no está de acuerdo con la decisión de la Junta de Apelación de Empleo, puede presentar una petición de revisión judicial en el tribunal de distrito.

2. Si no presenta una apelación de la decisión del juez ante la Junta de Apelación de Empleo dentro de los quince (15) días, la decisión se convierte en una acción final de la agencia y tiene la opción de presentar una petición de revisión judicial en el Tribunal de Distrito dentro de los treinta (30) días. Puede encontrar información adicional sobre cómo presentar una petición en <a href="https://www.iowacourts.gov/efile">www.iowacourts.gov/efile</a>. Puede haber una tarifa de presentación para presentar la petición en el Tribunal de Distrito.

**Nota para las partes:** USTED PUEDE REPRESENTARSE en la apelación u obtener un abogado u otra parte interesada para que lo haga, siempre que no haya gastos para Workforce Development. Si desea ser representado por un abogado, puede obtener los servicios de un abogado privado o uno cuyos servicios se paquen con fondos públicos.

**Nota para el reclamante:** es importante que presente su reclamo semanal según las instrucciones, mientras esta apelación está pendiente, para proteger su derecho continuo a los beneficios.

# **SERVICIO DE INFORMACIÓN:**

Se envió por correo una copia fiel y correcta de esta decisión a cada una de las partes enumeradas.