IOWA DEPARTMENT OF INSPECTIONS AND APPEALS ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS DIVISION, UI APPEALS BUREAU

JANET L BAIR Claimant

APPEAL 23A-UI-01452-AW-T

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE DECISION

BURLINGTON STAGE LINES LTD Employer

OC: 10/23/23 Claimant: Appellant (2)

Iowa Code § 96.5(1) – Voluntary Quitting

STATEMENT OF THE CASE:

Claimant filed an appeal from the February 9, 2023 (reference 05) unemployment insurance decision that denied benefits. The parties were properly notified of the hearing. A telephone hearing was held on March 10, 2023. Claimant participated. Employer participated through Human Resources Director Caylie Cherry. No exhibits were admitted.

ISSUE:

Whether claimant's separation was a voluntary quit without good cause attributable to employer.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

Having reviewed all of the evidence in the record, the administrative law judge finds:

Claimant was employed as a full-time Motor Coach Operator from November 28, 2022 until she resigned her employment with Burlington Stage Lines on January 19, 2023. Claimant's schedule varied. Claimant's direct supervisor was Caylie Cherry, Human Resources Director.

While claimant was being trained to drive the route between Des Moines, Iowa and Chicago, Illinois, the trainer directed claimant to exceed the posted speed limit. Claimant told Cherry what the trainer said about speeding. Cherry told claimant that employer does not condone speeding but to "go with the flow of traffic." Cherry did not speak with or correct the trainer. The trainer continued telling claimant to pick up speed when she had her cruise control set at the posted speed limit. Trainer also told claimant to "hammer it" when driving on the interstate and that he speed on that route all the time and had never received a speeding ticket.

Claimant resigned effective January 19, 2023, in part, because of the pressure she felt to speed and the conflicting direction she received from Cherry and the trainer. Employer had continuing work available for claimant. Claimant's job was not in jeopardy.

REASONING AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW:

For the reasons that follow, the administrative law judge concludes:

lowa Code § 96.5(1) provides: An individual shall be disqualified for benefits, if the individual has left work voluntarily without good cause attributable to the individual's employer, if so found by the department.

A voluntary quitting means discontinuing the employment because the employee no longer desires to remain in the relationship of an employee with the employer and requires an intention to terminate the employment. *Wills v. Emp't Appeal Bd.*, 447 N.W. 2d 137, 138 (Iowa 1989). A voluntary leaving of employment requires an intention to terminate the employment relationship accompanied by an overt act of carrying out that intention. *Local Lodge #1426 v. Wilson Trailer*, 289 N.W.2d 608, 612 (Iowa 1980); *Peck v. Emp't Appeal Bd.*, 492 N.W.2d 438 (Iowa Ct. App. 1992).

Claimant has the burden of proving that the voluntary leaving was for good cause attributable to the employer. Iowa Code § 96.6(2). "Good cause" for leaving employment must be that which is reasonable to the average person, not the overly sensitive individual or the claimant in particular. *Uniweld Products v. Indus. Relations Comm'n*, 277 So.2d 827 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. 1973). The standard of what a reasonable person would have believed under the circumstances is applied in determining whether a claimant left work voluntarily with good cause attributable to the employer. *O'Brien v. Employment Appeal Bd.*, 494 N.W.2d 660 (Iowa 1993).

Where a claimant gives numerous reasons for leaving employment the agency is required to consider all stated reasons which might combine to give the claimant good cause to quit in determining *any of those reasons* constitute good cause attributable to the employer. Taylor v. Iowa Dep't of Job Serv., 362 N.W.2d 534 (Iowa 1985) (emphasis added).

Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.26(4) provides:

Voluntary quit with good cause attributable to the employer and separations not considered to be voluntary quits. The following are reasons for a claimant leaving employment with good cause attributable to the employer:

(4) The claimant left due to intolerable or detrimental working conditions.

It is the duty of the administrative law judge, as the trier of fact, to determine the credibility of witnesses, weigh the evidence and decide the facts in issue. *Arndt v. City of LeClaire*, 728 N.W.2d 389, 394-395 (Iowa 2007). The administrative law judge may believe all, part or none of any witness's testimony. *State v. Holtz*, 548 N.W.2d 162, 163 (Iowa App. 1996). In assessing the credibility of witnesses, the administrative law judge should consider the evidence using his or her own observations, common sense and experience. *Id.* In determining the facts, and deciding what testimony to believe, the fact finder may consider the following factors: whether the testimony is reasonable and consistent with other evidence you believe; whether a witness has made inconsistent statements; the witness's appearance, conduct, age, intelligence, memory and knowledge of the facts; and the witness's interest in the trial, their motive, candor, bias and prejudice. *Id.*

The findings of fact show how I have resolved the disputed factual issues in this case. I assessed the credibility of the witnesses who testified during the hearing, considering the

applicable factors listed above, and using my own common sense and experience. I find claimant's testimony regarding the trainer's comments and feedback from Cherry to be credible.

Claimant voluntarily quit her employment because she was being told to speed by her trainer. When she brought the issue to Cherry's attention, Cherry told claimant to "go with the flow of traffic" but that employer doesn't condone speeding. Cherry's comment regarding the flow of traffic was unnecessary if employer's policy is to not exceed the speed limit. Cherry did not address the issue with the trainer, who continued to direct claimant to exceed the posted speed limit.

Claimant felt pressure to violate the law and take action that would endanger herself, her passengers and other vehicles on the road. This constitutes intolerable working conditions. Claimant voluntarily quit for good cause attributable to employer. Benefits are allowed provided claimant is otherwise eligible.

DECISION:

The February 9, 2023 (reference 05) unemployment insurance decision is REVERSED. Claimant voluntarily quit with good cause attributable to employer. Benefits are allowed provided claimant is otherwise eligible.

In MAN

Adrienne C. Williamson Administrative Law Judge

<u>March 13, 2023</u> Decision Dated and Mailed

mh

APPEAL RIGHTS. If you disagree with the decision, you or any interested party may:

1. Appeal to the Employment Appeal Board within fifteen (15) days of the date under the judge's signature by submitting a written appeal via mail, fax, or online to:

Employment Appeal Board 4th Floor – Lucas Building Des Moines, Iowa 50319 Fax: (515)281-7191 Online: eab.iowa.gov

The appeal period will be extended to the next business day if the last day to appeal falls on a weekend or a legal holiday.

AN APPEAL TO THE BOARD SHALL STATE CLEARLY:

1) The name, address, and social security number of the claimant.

- 2) A reference to the decision from which the appeal is taken.
- 3) That an appeal from such decision is being made and such appeal is signed.

4) The grounds upon which such appeal is based.

An Employment Appeal Board decision is final agency action. If a party disagrees with the Employment Appeal Board decision, they may then file a petition for judicial review in district court.

2. If no one files an appeal of the judge's decision with the Employment Appeal Board within fifteen (15) days, the decision becomes final agency action, and you have the option to file a petition for judicial review in District Court within thirty (30) days after the decision becomes final. Additional information on how to file a petition can be found at Iowa Code §17A.19, which is online at https://www.legis.iowa.gov/docs/code/17A.19.pdf or by contacting the District Court Clerk of Court https://www.iowacourts.gov/iowa-courts/court-directory/.

Note to Parties: YOU MAY REPRESENT yourself in the appeal or obtain a lawyer or other interested party to do so provided there is no expense to Workforce Development. If you wish to be represented by a lawyer, you may obtain the services of either a private attorney or one whose services are paid for with public funds.

Note to Claimant: It is important that you file your weekly claim as directed, while this appeal is pending, to protect your continuing right to benefits.

SERVICE INFORMATION:

A true and correct copy of this decision was mailed to each of the parties listed.

DERECHOS DE APELACIÓN. Si no está de acuerdo con la decisión, usted o cualquier parte interesada puede:

1. Apelar a la Junta de Apelaciones de Empleo dentro de los quince (15) días de la fecha bajo la firma del juez presentando una apelación por escrito por correo, fax o en línea a:

Employment Appeal Board 4th Floor – Lucas Building Des Moines, Iowa 50319 Fax: (515)281-7191 En línea: eab.iowa.gov

El período de apelación se extenderá hasta el siguiente día hábil si el último día para apelar cae en fin de semana o día feriado legal.

UNA APELACIÓN A LA JUNTA DEBE ESTABLECER CLARAMENTE:

1) El nombre, dirección y número de seguro social del reclamante.

2) Una referencia a la decisión de la que se toma la apelación.

3) Que se interponga recurso de apelación contra tal decisión y se firme dicho recurso.

4) Los fundamentos en que se funda dicho recurso.

Una decisión de la Junta de Apelaciones de Empleo es una acción final de la agencia. Si una de las partes no está de acuerdo con la decisión de la Junta de Apelación de Empleo, puede presentar una petición de revisión judicial en el tribunal de distrito.

2. Si nadie presenta una apelación de la decisión del juez ante la Junta de Apelaciones Laborales dentro de los quince (15) días, la decisión se convierte en acción final de la agencia y usted tiene la opción de presentar una petición de revisión judicial en el Tribunal de Distrito dentro de los treinta (30) días después de que la decisión adquiera firmeza. Puede encontrar información adicional sobre cómo presentar una petición en el Código de Iowa §17A.19, que se encuentra en línea en https://www.legis.iowa.gov/docs/code/17A.19.pdf o comunicándose con el Tribunal de Distrito Secretario del tribunal https://www.iowacourts.gov/iowa-courts/court-directory/.

Nota para las partes: USTED PUEDE REPRESENTARSE en la apelación u obtener un abogado u otra parte interesada para que lo haga, siempre que no haya gastos para Workforce Development. Si desea ser representado por un abogado, puede obtener los servicios de un abogado privado o uno cuyos servicios se paguen con fondos públicos.

Nota para el reclamante: es importante que presente su reclamo semanal según las instrucciones, mientras esta apelación está pendiente, para proteger su derecho continuo a los beneficios.

SERVICIO DE INFORMACIÓN:

Se envió por correo una copia fiel y correcta de esta decisión a cada una de las partes enumeradas.