

**IOWA WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT  
UNEMPLOYMENT INSURANCE APPEALS**

**MICHAEL R BROTHERTON**  
Claimant

**THE UNIVERSITY OF IOWA**  
Employer

**APPEAL NO. 21A-UI-08524-JTT**

**ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE  
DECISION**

**OC: 04/19/20**  
**Claimant: Appellant (1)**

Iowa Code Section 96.6(2) – Timeliness of Appeal  
Iowa Code Section 96.4(3) – Able & Available

**STATEMENT OF THE CASE:**

The claimant, Michael Brotherton, filed an appeal that the Appeals Bureau treated as a late appeal from the July 31, 2021, reference 01, decision that denied benefits for the period of April 19, 2020 through May 30, 2020, based on the deputy's conclusion the claimant was employed and therefore did not meet the "availability" requirement during that period. After due notice was issued, a hearing was held on June 8, 2021. The claimant participated. Jessica Wade represented the employer. There were two matters set for a consolidated hearing: 21A-UI-08524-JTT and 21A-08525-JTT. Exhibit A was received into the hearing record. The administrative law judge took official notice of the following Agency administrative records: DBRO, KCCO, NMRO, WAGE-A and the reference 01, 02 and 04 decisions.

**ISSUE:**

Whether the appeal was timely. Whether there is good cause to treat the appeal as timely.

**FINDINGS OF FACT:**

Having reviewed all of the evidence in the record, the administrative law judge finds: On July 31, 2020, Iowa Workforce Development mailed the July 31, 2020, reference 01, decision to the claimant at his Iowa City last-known address of record. The decision denied benefits for the period of April 19, 2020 through May 30, 2020, based on the deputy's conclusion the claimant was employed and therefore did not meet the "availability" requirement during that period. The decision stated that the decision would be final unless an appeal was postmarked by August 10, 2020 or was received by the Appeal Section by that date. The claimant received the decision in a timely manner and elected not to file an appeal by the appeal deadline.

On March 19, 2021, Iowa Workforce Development mailed a reference 04 decision to the claimant. On March 23, 2021, the claimant drafted and mailed an appeal from the overpayment decision. The appeal is postmarked March 23, 2021. The Appeals Bureau elected to treat the appeal from the reference 04 overpayment decision as also an appeal from the July 31, 2020, reference 01, decision.

## REASONING AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW:

Iowa Code section 96.6(2) provides:

2. Initial determination. A representative designated by the director shall promptly notify all interested parties to the claim of its filing, and the parties have ten days from the date of mailing the notice of the filing of the claim by ordinary mail to the last known address to protest payment of benefits to the claimant. The representative shall promptly examine the claim and any protest, take the initiative to ascertain relevant information concerning the claim, and, on the basis of the facts found by the representative, shall determine whether or not the claim is valid, the week with respect to which benefits shall commence, the weekly benefit amount payable and its maximum duration, and whether any disqualification shall be imposed. The claimant has the burden of proving that the claimant meets the basic eligibility conditions of section 96.4. The employer has the burden of proving that the claimant is disqualified for benefits pursuant to section 96.5, except as provided by this subsection. The claimant has the initial burden to produce evidence showing that the claimant is not disqualified for benefits in cases involving section 96.5, subsections 10 and 11, and has the burden of proving that a voluntary quit pursuant to section 96.5, subsection 1, was for good cause attributable to the employer and that the claimant is not disqualified for benefits in cases involving section 96.5, subsection 1, paragraphs "a" through "h". Unless the claimant or other interested party, after notification or within ten calendar days after notification was mailed to the claimant's last known address, files an appeal from the decision, the decision is final and benefits shall be paid or denied in accordance with the decision. If an administrative law judge affirms a decision of the representative, or the appeal board affirms a decision of the administrative law judge allowing benefits, the benefits shall be paid regardless of any appeal which is thereafter taken, but if the decision is finally reversed, no employer's account shall be charged with benefits so paid and this relief from charges shall apply to both contributory and reimbursable employers, notwithstanding section 96.8, subsection 5.

The ten-day deadline for appeal begins to run on the date Workforce Development mails the decision to the parties. The "decision date" found in the upper right-hand portion of the Agency representative's decision, unless otherwise corrected immediately below that entry, is presumptive evidence of the date of mailing. *Gaskins v. Unempl. Comp. Bd. of Rev.*, 429 A.2d 138 (Pa. Comm. 1981); *Johnson v. Board of Adjustment*, 239 N.W.2d 873, 92 A.L.R.3d 304 (Iowa 1976).

An appeal submitted by mail is deemed filed on the date it is mailed as shown by the postmark or in the absence of a postmark the postage meter mark of the envelope in which it was received, or if not postmarked or postage meter marked or if the mark is illegible, on the date entered on the document as the date of completion. See Iowa Administrative Code rule 871-24.35(1)(a). See also *Messina v. IDJS*, 341 N.W.2d 52 (Iowa 1983). An appeal submitted by any other means is deemed filed on the date it is received by the Unemployment Insurance Division of Iowa Workforce Development. See Iowa Administrative Code rule 871-24.35(1)(b).

The evidence in the record establishes that more than ten calendar days elapsed between the mailing date and the date this appeal was filed. The Iowa Supreme Court has declared that there is a mandatory duty to file appeals from representatives' decisions within the time allotted by statute, and that the administrative law judge has no authority to change the decision of a representative if a timely appeal is not filed. *Franklin v. IDJS*, 277 N.W.2d 877, 881 (Iowa 1979). Compliance with appeal notice provisions is jurisdictional unless the facts of a case

show that the notice was invalid. *Beardslee v. IDJS*, 276 N.W.2d 373, 377 (Iowa 1979); see also *In re Appeal of Elliott*, 319 N.W.2d 244, 247 (Iowa 1982). The question in this case thus becomes whether the appellant was deprived of a reasonable opportunity to assert an appeal in a timely fashion. *Hendren v. IESC*, 217 N.W.2d 255 (Iowa 1974); *Smith v. IESC*, 212 N.W.2d 471, 472 (Iowa 1973).

The appeal, as it relates to the July 31, 2020, reference 01, decision is untimely. The claimant received the reference 01 decision in a timely manner, had a reasonable opportunity to file an appeal by the appeal deadline, but elected not to file an appeal by the appeal deadline. The untimeliness of the appeal from the July 31, 2020, reference 01, decision was not attributable to Iowa Workforce Development or to the United States Postal Service. There is not good cause to treat the late appeal as a timely appeal. See Iowa Administrative Code rule 871-24.35(2). Because the appeal was untimely, the administrative law judge lacks jurisdiction to disturb the July 31, 2020, reference 01, decision. See *Beardslee v. IDJS*, 276 N.W.2d 373 (Iowa 1979) and *Franklin v. IDJS*, 277 N.W.2d 877 (Iowa 1979).

#### DECISION:

The claimant's appeal from the July 31, 2021, reference 01, decision was untimely. The decision that denied benefits for the period of April 19, 2020 through May 30, 2020, based on the deputy's conclusion the claimant was employed and therefore did not meet the "availability" requirement during that period, remains in effect.



---

James E. Timberland  
Administrative Law Judge

June 21, 2021  
Decision Dated and Mailed

jet/mh

**NOTE TO CLAIMANT:** This decision determines you are not eligible for regular unemployment insurance benefits. If you disagree with this decision you may file an appeal to the Employment Appeal Board by following the instructions on the first page of this decision. Individuals who do not qualify for regular unemployment insurance benefits, but who are unemployed or continue to be unemployed for reasons related to COVID-19 may qualify for Pandemic Unemployment Assistance (PUA). **You will need to apply for PUA to determine your eligibility under the program.** Additional information on how to apply for PUA can be found at <https://www.iowaworkforcedevelopment.gov/pua-information>. If this decision becomes final or if you are not eligible for PUA, you may have an overpayment of benefits that you must repay.

**ATTENTION:** On May 11, 2021, Governor Reynolds announced that Iowa will end its participation in federal pandemic-related unemployment benefit programs effective June 12,

2021. The last payable week for PUA in Iowa will be the week ending June 12, 2021. Additional information can be found in the press release at <https://www.iowaworkforcedevelopment.gov/iowa-end-participation-federal-unemployment-benefit-programs-citing-strong-labor-market-and>.