

**IOWA WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT
UNEMPLOYMENT INSURANCE APPEALS BUREAU**

JILL E HINDERKS-SMITH
Claimant

WIELAND DEVELOPMENT LLC
Employer

APPEAL 17A-UI-00903-DL-T

**ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE
DECISION**

**OC: 01/08/17
Claimant: Respondent (6)**

Iowa Code § 17A.12(3) – Default Decision
Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-26.14(7) – Dismissal of Appeal on Default

STATEMENT OF THE CASE:

An appeal was filed from an unemployment insurance decision dated January 20, 2017, (reference 01) that allowed benefits based upon a layoff due to a lack of work. Notice of hearing was mailed to the parties' last-known addresses of record for a telephone hearing to be held at 9:00 a.m. on February 15, 2017. A review of the Appeals Bureau's conference call system shows the appellant was not available at the telephone number registered for the hearing and did not participate in the hearing. The appellant called after the hearing record was closed.

ISSUES:

Should the hearing record be reopened?
Should the appeal be dismissed based upon the appellant not participating in the hearing?

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The parties were properly notified of the scheduled hearing for this appeal. Official notice of the Clear2there hearing control screen is taken to establish that appellant did not answer when called at the number provided at registration. The hearing notice was mailed to the parties on January 30, 2017, and the representative did not call the number on the hearing notice to ask for a postponement because of a scheduling conflict. After the hearing record was closed at the end of the grace period, the appellant called to report it was not available for the hearing at the number provided because the representative was in a meeting.

The front of the hearing notice instruction specifically advises in English and Spanish:

WED FEB 15, 2017 Date
9:00 AM Iowa Time

You must register for the hearing immediately!

You must register your phone number and the name(s) and phone number(s) of any witness(es) with the Appeals Bureau. If you do not register, the judge will not be able to call you or your witness(es) for the hearing.

The back page of the hearing notice provides further instruction and warning in both languages:
If you do not participate in the hearing the judge may dismiss the appeal or issue a decision without considering your evidence or witness(es).

As a *courtesy* to the appellant the record was left open for a minimum grace period of 15 minutes after the hearing start time to give the appellant a *reasonable* opportunity to participate. Allowing additional time would prejudice the non-appealing party for appearing in a timely manner. Holding the appellant in default for failure to appear and participate during a 15-minute window after the hearing start time is reasonable.

The representative's decision concluded that the claimant was eligible for unemployment insurance benefits.

REASONING AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW:

The Iowa Administrative Procedure Act at Iowa Code section 17A.12(3) provides in pertinent part:

If a party fails to appear or participate in a contested case proceeding after proper service of notice, the presiding officer may, if no adjournment is granted, enter a default decision or proceed with the hearing and make a decision in the absence of the party. ... If a decision is rendered against a party who failed to appear for the hearing and the presiding officer is timely requested by that party to vacate the decision for good cause, the time for initiating a further appeal is stayed pending a determination by the presiding officer to grant or deny the request. If adequate reasons are provided showing good cause for the party's failure to appear, the presiding officer shall vacate the decision and, after proper service of notice, conduct another evidentiary hearing. **If adequate reasons are not provided showing good cause for the party's failure to appear, the presiding officer *shall deny* the motion to vacate.**

Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-26.14(7) provides:

Conduct of hearings.

(7) If a party has not responded to a notice of telephone hearing by providing the appeals bureau with the names and telephone numbers of the persons who are participating in the hearing by the scheduled starting time of the hearing or is not available at the telephone number provided, the presiding officer may proceed with the hearing. If the appealing party fails to provide a telephone number or is unavailable for the hearing, the presiding officer may decide the appealing party is in default and dismiss the appeal as provide in Iowa Code section 17A.12(3). The record may be reopened if the absent party makes a request to reopen the hearing under subrule 26.8(3) and shows good cause for reopening the hearing.

a. If an absent party responds to the hearing notice while the hearing is in progress, the presiding officer shall pause to admit the party, summarize the hearing to that point, administer the oath, and resume the hearing.

b. If a party responds to the notice of hearing after the record has been closed and any party which has participated is no longer on the telephone line, the presiding officer shall not take the evidence of the late party. Instead, the presiding officer shall inquire ex parte as to why the party was late in responding to the notice of hearing. For good cause shown, the presiding officer shall reopen the record and cause further notice of hearing to be issued to all parties of record. The record shall not be reopened if the presiding officer does not find good cause for the party's late response to the notice of hearing.

- c. Failure to read or follow the instructions on the notice of hearing shall not constitute good cause for reopening the record.

The Iowa Supreme Court has opined that a default *should not be set aside for ordinary negligence or want of ordinary care*. Defaults should not be set aside where the movant ignores plain instruction with ample opportunity to comply. See *Houlihan v. Emp't Appeal Bd.*, 545 N.W.2d 863 (Iowa 1996). (Emphasis added.) Here the clear directive is to read the hearing notice and register a telephone number where the party can be reached for the hearing. The second part of that directive is to be available at the number provided at the date and time of the hearing. Further, if the party misses or does not receive the hearing call, the party has telephone numbers on the hearing notice at which to inquire. Due process requires notice and an opportunity to be heard, both of which were provided to each party. It is assumed an appellant intends to participate in the hearing simply by the fact that an appeal is filed, but the appellant's responsibility does not end there. Each party is held to the same standard and is required to follow the prominent, specific written instructions printed on the hearing notice in order to participate in an appeal hearing. The appellant filed the appeal and is held solely responsible for going forward with the case in a prompt and deliberate manner. The rule holds an appellant in default if not present *at the start* of hearing. As a courtesy, appellant was granted an additional 15-minute grace period not required by statute or rule. *The rule does not provide exceptions for good intentions and/or a party contacting the Appeals Bureau within a 'reasonable' or certain amount of time after the hearing is scheduled.* Here, notwithstanding notice, opportunity and additional time, the appellant failed to prosecute the case at the appointed date and time without providing a good-cause reason for the delay or failure to do so. Accordingly the appellant is in default and the appeal shall be dismissed. Iowa Code § 17A.12(3) and Iowa Admin. Code r. 26.14(7). The unemployment insurance decision remains in force and effect.

DECISION:

The appellant is in default and the appeal is dismissed. The record shall not be reopened. The unemployment insurance decision dated January 20, 2017, (reference 01) granting benefits remains in effect.

Dévon M. Lewis
Administrative Law Judge

Decision Dated and Mailed

dml/rvs