## IN THE IOWA ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS DIVISION UNEMPLOYMENT INSURANCE APPEALS BUREAU

CYNDI SHOEMAKER Claimant

### APPEAL 23A-UI-07291-DS-T

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE DECISION

BCP UNION PARK LLC Employer

> OC: 05/21/23 Claimant: Appellant (1)

Iowa Code § 96.5(1) – Voluntary Quitting Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.26(19) – Voluntary Quit

# STATEMENT OF THE CASE:

On July 22, 2023, the claimant filed an appeal from the unemployment insurance decision dated July 13, 2023, (Reference 01) that denied benefits. Notice of hearing was mailed to the parties' last known addresses of record for a telephone hearing to be held at 9:00 a.m. on August 10, 2023. The claimant participated personally. The employer participated through Nina Fowler, Employer Representative, and Madison Long, Human Resources Director. Employer's Exhibits 1-3 were admitted to the record. The administrative law judge took official notice of the administrative record.

# **ISSUE:**

Did claimant voluntarily quit the employment without good cause attributable to employer?

# FINDINGS OF FACT:

The administrative law judge finds that:

The claimant worked for this employer from February 3, 2023, until May 18, 2023, when she voluntarily quit the employment. The claimant was a Certified Nursing Assistant. The claimant primarily worked weekends. In the final weeks of the claimant's employment, there were numerous complaints to the employer regarding the claimant's interactions with her co-workers during her shifts. The claimant was in nearly constant conflict with her co-workers and supervisor, including arguing about duties and the delegation of tasks on the shift. The claimant regularly made threats to contact state regulators in the midst of these conflicts. On the weekend of May 13, 2023, the claimant had a particularly tumultuous shift during which she argued with multiple staff members and the Charge Nurse, refused to complete resident showers as directed by the Director of Nursing, and repeatedly threatened to contact state authorities about her disagreements with the administration. That day, the claimant surreptitiously recorded part of her argument with a co-worker. The claimant was eventually sent home early by the Director of Nursing due to all of the conflict that was taking place during her presence in the workplace.

The employer met with the claimant on May 18, 2023, and intended to issue a disciplinary warning and corrective action to her during that meeting. The claimant played her recording from the

weekend for the employer, and it did not reveal anything of interest to the employer. The employer told the claimant that the "drama" has to stop between the claimant and her co-workers, at which point the claimant told the employer she was "done" and resigned her position. Continuing work was available to the claimant had she not quit the employment.

### **REASONING AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW:**

For the reasons that follow, the administrative law judge concludes claimant's separation from the employment was without good cause attributable to the employer. Benefits are denied.

Iowa Code section 96.5(1) provides:

An individual shall be disqualified for benefits, regardless of the source of the individual's wage credits:

1. Voluntary quitting. If the individual has left work voluntarily without good cause attributable to the individual's employer, if so found by the department.

Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.25(4) provides:

Voluntary quit without good cause. In general, a voluntary quit means discontinuing the employment because the employee no longer desires to remain in the relationship of an employee with the employer from whom the employee has separated. The employer has the burden of proving that the claimant is disqualified for benefits pursuant to Iowa Code section 96.5. However, the claimant has the initial burden to produce evidence that the claimant is not disqualified for benefits in cases involving Iowa Code section 96.5, subsection (1), paragraphs "a" through "i," and subsection 10. The following reasons for a voluntary quit shall be presumed to be without good cause attributable to the employer:

(4) The claimant was absent for three days without giving notice to employer in violation of company rule.

The claimant has the burden of proving that the voluntary leaving was for good cause attributable to the employer. Iowa Code § 96.6(2). "Good cause" for leaving employment must be that which is reasonable to the average person, not the overly sensitive individual or the claimant in particular. *Uniweld Products v. Indus. Relations Comm'n*, 277 So.2d 827 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. 1973). A voluntary leaving of employment requires an intention to terminate the employment relationship accompanied by an overt act of carrying out that intention. *Local Lodge #1426 v. Wilson Trailer*, 289 N.W.2d 608, 612 (Iowa 1980).

It is the duty of the administrative law judge, as the trier of fact, to determine the credibility of witnesses, weigh the evidence and decide the facts in issue. *Arndt v. City of LeClaire*, 728 N.W.2d 389, 394-395 (Iowa 2007).

The administrative law judge may believe all, part or none of any witness's testimony. *State v. Holtz*, 548 N.W.2d 162, 163 (Iowa App. 1996). In assessing the credibility of witnesses, the administrative law judge should consider the evidence using his or her own observations, common sense and experience. Id. In determining the facts, and deciding what testimony to believe, the fact finder may consider the following factors: whether the testimony is reasonable and consistent with other evidence you believe; whether a witness has made inconsistent

statements; the witness's appearance, conduct, age, intelligence, memory and knowledge of the facts; and the witness's interest in the trial, their motive, candor, bias and prejudice. *Id*.

This administrative law judge is not persuaded that the claimant was discharged by the employer. Rather, the claimant quit the employment in lieu of participating in the corrective action process. The fact that the claimant was about to receive corrective action does not constitute good cause for quitting the employment. Benefits are denied.

### **DECISION:**

The July 13, 2023, (Reference 01) unemployment insurance decision denying benefits is AFFIRMED. The claimant voluntarily left the employment without good cause attributable to the employer. Benefits are withheld until such time as she has worked in and been paid wages for insured work equal to ten times her weekly benefit amount, provided she is otherwise eligible.

David J. Steen Administrative Law Judge Iowa Department of Inspections, Appeals and Licensing Administrative Hearings Division - UI Appeals Bureau

August 17, 2023 Decision Dated and Mailed

rvs

**APPEAL RIGHTS.** If you disagree with the decision, you or any interested party may:

1. Appeal to the Employment Appeal Board within fifteen (15) days of the date under the judge's signature by submitting a written appeal via mail, fax, or online to:

### Employment Appeal Board 4<sup>th</sup> Floor – Lucas Building Des Moines, Iowa 50319 Fax: (515)281-7191 Online: eab.iowa.gov

The appeal period will be extended to the next business day if the last day to appeal falls on a weekend or a legal holiday. *There is no filing fee to file an appeal with the Employment Appeal Board.* 

#### AN APPEAL TO THE BOARD SHALL STATE CLEARLY:

- 1) The name, address, and social security number of the claimant.
- 2) A reference to the decision from which the appeal is taken.
- 3) That an appeal from such decision is being made and such appeal is signed.
- 4) The grounds upon which such appeal is based.

An Employment Appeal Board decision is final agency action. If a party disagrees with the Employment Appeal Board decision, they may file a petition for judicial review in district court.

2. If you do not file an appeal of the judge's decision with the Employment Appeal Board within fifteen (15) days, the decision becomes final agency action, and you have the option to file a petition for judicial review in District Court within thirty (30) days after the decision becomes final. Additional information on how to file a petition can be found at <a href="https://www.iowacourts.gov/efile">www.iowacourts.gov/efile</a>. There may be a filing fee to file the petition in District Court.

**Note to Parties:** YOU MAY REPRESENT yourself in the appeal or obtain a lawyer or other interested party to do so provided there is no expense to Workforce Development. If you wish to be represented by a lawyer, you may obtain the services of either a private attorney or one whose services are paid for with public funds.

**Note to Claimant:** It is important that you file your weekly claim as directed, while this appeal is pending, to protect your continuing right to benefits.

#### **SERVICE INFORMATION:**

A true and correct copy of this decision was mailed to each of the parties listed.

**DERECHOS DE APELACIÓN.** Si no está de acuerdo con la decisión, usted o cualquier parte interesada puede:

1. Apelar a la Junta de Apelaciones de Empleo dentro de los quince (15) días de la fecha bajo la firma del juez presentando una apelación por escrito por correo, fax o en línea a:

### Employment Appeal Board 4th Floor – Lucas Building Des Moines, Iowa 50319 Fax: (515)281-7191 En línea: eab.iowa.gov

El período de apelación se extenderá hasta el siguiente día hábil si el último día para apelar cae en fin de semana o día feriado legal. *No hay tarifa de presentación para presentar una apelación ante la Junta de Apelación de Empleo.* 

UNA APELACIÓN A LA JUNTA DEBE ESTABLECER CLARAMENTE:

- 1) El nombre, dirección y número de seguro social del reclamante.
- 2) Una referencia a la decisión de la que se toma la apelación.
- 3) Que se interponga recurso de apelación contra tal decisión y se firme dicho recurso.
- 4) Los fundamentos en que se funda dicho recurso.

Una decisión de la Junta de Apelaciones de Empleo es una acción final de la agencia. Si una de las partes no está de acuerdo con la decisión de la Junta de Apelación de Empleo, puede presentar una petición de revisión judicial en el tribunal de distrito.

2. Si no presenta una apelación de la decisión del juez ante la Junta de Apelación de Empleo dentro de los quince (15) días, la decisión se convierte en una acción final de la agencia y tiene la opción de presentar una petición de revisión judicial en el Tribunal de Distrito dentro de los treinta (30) días. Puede encontrar información adicional sobre cómo presentar una petición en www.iowacourts.gov/efile. Puede haber una tarifa de presentación para presentar la petición en el Tribunal de Distrito.

**Nota para las partes:** USTED PUEDE REPRESENTARSE en la apelación u obtener un abogado u otra parte interesada para que lo haga, siempre que no haya gastos para Workforce Development. Si desea ser representado por un abogado, puede obtener los servicios de un abogado privado o uno cuyos servicios se paguen con fondos públicos.

**Nota para el reclamante:** es importante que presente su reclamo semanal según las instrucciones, mientras esta apelación está pendiente, para proteger su derecho continuo a los beneficios.

# SERVICIO DE INFORMACIÓN:

Se envió por correo una copia fiel y correcta de esta decisión a cada una de las partes enumeradas.