IOWA DEPARTMENT OF INSPECTIONS AND APPEALS ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS DIVISION, UI APPEALS BUREAU

PHYLLIS J MOWRY

Claimant

APPEAL 23A-UI-05087-PT-T

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE DECISION

BAD PROPERTIES LLC

Employer

OC: 01/29/23

Claimant: Respondent (1R)

Iowa Code § 96.6(2) – Timeliness of Protest Iowa Code § 96.7(2)a(6) – Appeal from the Statement of Charges

STATEMENT OF THE CASE:

On May 16, 2023, Bad Properties LLC (employer) filed an appeal from the statement of charges dated May 9, 2023, for the first quarter of 2023. After due notice, a hearing was held on June 26, 2023. The claimant did not participate. The employer participated through Owner Brian Devaul and Manager Bobbi Devaul. The administrative law judge took official notice of the claimant's unemployment insurance benefits records including the above-mentioned statement of charges for the first quarter of 2023.

ISSUES:

Was the employer's protest timely? Was the employer's appeal from the statement of charges timely?

FINDINGS OF FACT:

Having reviewed all of the evidence in the record, the administrative law judge finds: The notice of claim was mailed to the employer's address of record on February 6, 2023. However, the employer's mailing address in Iowa Workforce Development's system contained a typographical error and the notice of claim went to an incorrect address. The employer did not receive the notice of claim. On May 9, 2023, a statement of charges for the first quarter of 2023 was mailed to the same incorrect address. However, the employer eventually received the statement of charges and filed its appeal of that statement of charges on May 16, 2023.

There has been no initial investigation and determination regarding claimant's separation from this employer.

REASONING AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW:

For the reasons that follow, the administrative law judge concludes the employer did file a timely appeal to the statement of charges.

Iowa Code section 96.6(2) provides, in pertinent part:

2. *Initial determination*. A representative designated by the director shall promptly notify all interested parties to the claim of its filing, and the parties have ten days from the date of mailing the notice of the filing of the claim by ordinary mail to the last known address to protest payment of benefits to the claimant.

Another portion of this same Code section dealing with timeliness of an appeal from a representative's decision states that such an appeal must be filed within ten days after notification of that decision was mailed. In addressing an issue of timeliness of an appeal under that portion of this Code section, the lowa Supreme Court held that this statute prescribing the time for notice of appeal clearly limits the time to do so, and that compliance with the appeal notice provision is mandatory and jurisdictional. Beardslee v. lowa Dep't of Job Serv., 276 N.W.2d 373 (lowa 1979). The administrative law judge considers the reasoning and holding of that court in that decision to be controlling on this portion of that same lowa Code section which deals with a time limit in which to file a protest after notification of the filing of the claim has been mailed.

An exception exists to filing a response within ten days if there is credible evidence that the delay was due to agency error, misinformation or delay, or other action of the United States Postal Service pursuant to Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-24.35(2). If the employer has failed to file a timely protest pursuant to Iowa Code § 96.6(2), the administrative law judge lacks jurisdiction to make any determination with respect to the nature of the claimant's separation from employment. See *Beardslee*, 276 N.W.2d 373 (Iowa 1979).

In this case, the employer presented credible evidence that it did not receive the notice of claim mailed to it on February 6, 2023. As such, the statement of charges was the first notification the employer received regarding the allowance of benefits to the claimant.

Iowa Code section 96.7(2)a(6) provides:

- 2. Contribution rates based on benefit experience.
- a. (6) Within forty days after the close of each calendar quarter, the department shall notify each employer of the amount of benefits charged to the employer's account during that quarter. The notification shall show the name of each individual to whom benefits were paid, the individual's social security number, and the amount of benefits paid to the individual. An employer which has not been notified as provided in section 96.6, subsection 2, of the allowance of benefits to an individual, *may within thirty days after the date of mailing of the notification appeal to the department for a hearing to determine the eligibility of the individual to receive benefits.* The appeal shall be referred to an administrative law judge for hearing and the employer and the individual shall receive notice of the time and place of the hearing. [Emphasis added.]

Iowa Admin. Code r. 871-26.4 provides, in relevant part:

- 2. An appeal from an initial decision concerning the allowance or denial of benefits shall be filed, by mail, facsimile, or e-mail, online, or in person, not later than ten calendar days, as determined by the postmark or the date stamp after the decision was mailed to the party at its last-known address and shall state the following:
- a. The name, address and social security number of the claimant;
- b. A reference to the decision from which appeal is taken; and,

- c. The grounds upon which the appeal is based.
- 3. Notwithstanding the provisions of subrule 26.4(2), a contributory employer, which has not previously received a notice of the filing of a valid claim for benefits, may appeal an individual's eligibility to receive benefits within 30 days from the mailing date of the quarterly statement of benefit charges.
- 4. Also notwithstanding the provisions of subrule 26.4(2), a reimbursable employer, which has not previously received a notice of the filing of a valid claim for benefits, may appeal an individual's eligibility to receive benefits within 15 days of the mailing date of the quarterly billing of benefit charges.

An employer is only allowed to appeal the statement of charges for a hearing to determine the eligibility of the individual to receive benefits if they were not previously notified pursuant to lowa Code § 96.6(2) of the allowance of benefits. In this case, employer was not previously notified of the claim because the employer did not receive the notice. Therefore, it had no opportunity to file a protest objecting to claimant's eligibility for benefits after the separation. The employer's appeal, filed on May 16, 2023, was filed within thirty days of the date of mailing of the statement of charges and is timely.

The issue of whether claimant's separation from employment was disqualifying shall be remanded to the Benefits Bureau of Iowa Workforce Development for an initial investigation and determination.

DECISION:

The May 9, 2023, statement of charges for the first quarter of 2023 is affirmed pending the outcome of the remanded issue. The employer has filed a timely appeal from the statement of charges, as the notice of claim was not received.

REMAND:

The issue of whether claimant's separation from employment was disqualifying is remanded to the Benefits Bureau of Iowa Workforce Development for an initial investigation and determination.

Patrick B. Thomas

Administrative Law Judge

June 30, 2023

Decision Dated and Mailed

pbt/scn

APPEAL RIGHTS. If you disagree with the decision, you or any interested party may:

1. Appeal to the Employment Appeal Board within fifteen (15) days of the date under the judge's signature by submitting a written appeal via mail, fax, or online to:

Employment Appeal Board 4th Floor – Lucas Building Des Moines, Iowa 50319 Fax: (515)281-7191 Online: eab.iowa.gov

The appeal period will be extended to the next business day if the last day to appeal falls on a weekend or a legal holiday.

AN APPEAL TO THE BOARD SHALL STATE CLEARLY:

- 1) The name, address, and social security number of the claimant.
- 2) A reference to the decision from which the appeal is taken.
- 3) That an appeal from such decision is being made and such appeal is signed.
- 4) The grounds upon which such appeal is based.

An Employment Appeal Board decision is final agency action. If a party disagrees with the Employment Appeal Board decision, they may then file a petition for judicial review in district court.

2. If no one files an appeal of the judge's decision with the Employment Appeal Board within fifteen (15) days, the decision becomes final agency action, and you have the option to file a petition for judicial review in District Court within thirty (30) days after the decision becomes final. Additional information on how to file a petition can be found at lowa Code §17A.19, which is online at https://www.legis.iowa.gov/docs/code/17A.19.pdf or by contacting the District Court Clerk of Court https://www.iowacourts.gov/iowa-courts/court-directory/.

Note to Parties: YOU MAY REPRESENT yourself in the appeal or obtain a lawyer or other interested party to do so provided there is no expense to Workforce Development. If you wish to be represented by a lawyer, you may obtain the services of either a private attorney or one whose services are paid for with public funds.

Note to Claimant: It is important that you file your weekly claim as directed, while this appeal is pending, to protect your continuing right to benefits.

SERVICE INFORMATION:

A true and correct copy of this decision was mailed to each of the parties listed.

DERECHOS DE APELACIÓN. Si no está de acuerdo con la decisión, usted o cualquier parte interesada puede:

1. Apelar a la Junta de Apelaciones de Empleo dentro de los quince (15) días de la fecha bajo la firma del juez presentando una apelación por escrito por correo, fax o en línea a:

Employment Appeal Board 4th Floor – Lucas Building Des Moines, Iowa 50319 Fax: (515)281-7191 En línea: eab.iowa.gov

El período de apelación se extenderá hasta el siguiente día hábil si el último día para apelar cae en fin de semana o día feriado legal.

UNA APELACIÓN A LA JUNTA DEBE ESTABLECER CLARAMENTE:

- 1) El nombre, dirección y número de seguro social del reclamante.
- 2) Una referencia a la decisión de la que se toma la apelación.
- 3) Que se interponga recurso de apelación contra tal decisión y se firme dicho recurso.
- 4) Los fundamentos en que se funda dicho recurso.

Una decisión de la Junta de Apelaciones de Empleo es una acción final de la agencia. Si una de las partes no está de acuerdo con la decisión de la Junta de Apelación de Empleo, puede presentar una petición de revisión judicial en el tribunal de distrito.

2. Si nadie presenta una apelación de la decisión del juez ante la Junta de Apelaciones Laborales dentro de los quince (15) días, la decisión se convierte en acción final de la agencia y usted tiene la opción de presentar una petición de revisión judicial en el Tribunal de Distrito dentro de los treinta (30) días después de que la decisión adquiera firmeza. Puede encontrar información adicional sobre cómo presentar una petición en el Código de Iowa §17A.19, que se encuentra en línea en https://www.legis.iowa.gov/docs/code/17A.19.pdf o comunicándose con el Tribunal de Distrito Secretario del tribunal https:///www.iowacourts.gov/iowa-courts/court-directory/.

Nota para las partes: USTED PUEDE REPRESENTARSE en la apelación u obtener un abogado u otra parte interesada para que lo haga, siempre que no haya gastos para Workforce Development. Si desea ser representado por un abogado, puede obtener los servicios de un abogado privado o uno cuyos servicios se paguen con fondos públicos.

Nota para el reclamante: es importante que presente su reclamo semanal según las instrucciones, mientras esta apelación está pendiente, para proteger su derecho continuo a los beneficios.

SERVICIO DE INFORMACIÓN:

Se envió por correo una copia fiel y correcta de esta decisión a cada una de las partes enumeradas.