IOWA WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT UNEMPLOYMENT INSURANCE APPEALS

68-0157 (9-06) - 3091078 - EI

JANE A WILLIS

Claimant

APPEAL NO. 11A-UI-01825-LT

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE DECISION

WASHINGTON CARE CENTER INC

Employer

OC: 01/09/11

Claimant: Appellant (2)

Iowa Code § 96.5(2)a – Discharge for Misconduct Iowa Code § 96.5(1) – Voluntary Leaving

STATEMENT OF THE CASE:

The claimant filed a timely appeal from the February 7, 2011 (reference 01) decision that denied benefits. After due notice was issued, a telephone conference hearing was held on March 17, 2011. Claimant participated. Employer participated through Administrator Marty Wills.

ISSUE:

The issue is whether claimant quit the employment without good cause attributable to the employer or if she was discharged for reasons related to job misconduct sufficient to warrant a denial of unemployment benefits.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

Having heard the testimony and having reviewed the evidence in the record, the administrative law judge finds: Claimant most recently worked full-time as a DON and was separated from employment on January 10, 2011. On December 30, 2010, she gave her 30-day notice of intention to resign from the DON position and step into a charge nurse position, three of which were open. The employer did not respond to the resignation letter or otherwise tell her at anytime between December 30 and January 10 that she must remain as DON or leave the employment. Had she known she could not have retained employment as a charge nurse, she would not have resigned the DON position. On January 10, 2011, new management took over. She was told to gather her belongings because she was let go and was escorted from the building without reason. Employer paid her through the end of the month.

REASONING AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW:

For the reasons that follow, the administrative law judge concludes claimant did not quit but was discharged from employment for no disqualifying reason.

Iowa Code § 96.5-1 provides:

An individual shall be disqualified for benefits:

1. Voluntary quitting. If the individual has left work voluntarily without good cause attributable to the individual's employer, if so found by the department.

Iowa Code § 96.5-2-a provides:

An individual shall be disqualified for benefits:

- 2. Discharge for misconduct. If the department finds that the individual has been discharged for misconduct in connection with the individual's employment:
- a. The individual shall be disqualified for benefits until the individual has worked in and has been paid wages for insured work equal to ten times the individual's weekly benefit amount, provided the individual is otherwise eligible.

871 IAC 24.32(1)a provides:

Discharge for misconduct.

- (1) Definition.
- a. "Misconduct" is defined as a deliberate act or omission by a worker which constitutes a material breach of the duties and obligations arising out of such worker's contract of employment. Misconduct as the term is used in the disqualification provision as being limited to conduct evincing such willful or wanton disregard of an employer's interest as is found in deliberate violation or disregard of standards of behavior which the employer has the right to expect of employees, or in carelessness or negligence of such degree of recurrence as to manifest equal culpability, wrongful intent or evil design, or to show an intentional and substantial disregard of the employer's interests or of the employee's duties and obligations to the employer. On the other hand mere inefficiency, unsatisfactory conduct, failure in good performance as the result of inability or incapacity, inadvertencies or ordinary negligence in isolated instances, or good faith errors in judgment or discretion are not to be deemed misconduct within the meaning of the statute.

A voluntary leaving of employment requires an intention to terminate the employment relationship accompanied by an overt act of carrying out that intention. *Local Lodge #1426 v. Wilson Trailer*, 289 N.W.2d 608, 612 (Iowa 1980). Where a claimant walked off the job without permission before the end of his shift saying he wanted a meeting with management the next day, the Iowa Court of Appeals ruled this was not a voluntary quit because the claimant's expressed desire to meet with management was evidence that he wished to maintain the employment relationship. Such cases must be analyzed as a discharge from employment. *Peck v. EAB*, 492 N.W.2d 438 (Iowa App. 1992).

Claimant clearly stated that she was resigning only her DON position and wished to remain as charge nurse. Since employer did not respond to the letter, it is considered to have accepted the terms by default. Then when the employer opted not to allow her to continue working as a charge nurse and escorted her from the building, the separation became a discharge from employment and the burden of proof falls to the employer.

The employer has the burden of proof in establishing disqualifying job misconduct. *Cosper v. Iowa Department of Job Service*, 321 N.W.2d 6 (Iowa 1982). The issue is not whether the employer made a correct decision in separating claimant, but whether the claimant is entitled to unemployment insurance benefits. *Infante v. IDJS*, 364 N.W.2d 262 (Iowa App. 1984).

An employer may discharge an employee for any number of reasons or no reason at all if it is not contrary to public policy, but if it fails to meet its burden of proof to establish job-related misconduct as the reason for the separation, employer incurs potential liability for unemployment insurance benefits related to that separation. Inasmuch as claimant simply wanted to move from one position to another, employer has not met the burden of proof to establish that claimant engaged in misconduct. Benefits are allowed.

DECISION:

dml/kjw

The February 7, 2011 (reference 01) decision is reversed. Claimant did not quit but was discharged from employment for no disqualifying reason. Benefits are allowed, provided she is otherwise eligible. The benefits withheld shall be paid to claimant.

Dévon M. Lewis
Administrative Law Judge

Decision Dated and Mailed